Reflective debriefing

“While simulation itself often seems like “the main event,” postsimulation debriefing plays a crucial role in helping learners sustain good or improve weak performance”

2017
Kivinen Eveliina
Lahti University of applied science
Debriefing is defined as an activity that follows a simulation experience led by a facilitator where feedback is provided on the simulation participants’ performance while positive aspects of the completed simulation are discussed and reflective thinking encouraged (SIRC glossary).
Poorly performed debriefing or learning without guidance

- Can result in misinformation, bad habits, humiliation, and decreased involvement (Rall et al. 2000)

- Can lead the learner to negatively transfer a mistake into their practice without realizing it had been poor practice, repeat mistakes, focus only on the negative, or develop fixations (Decker et al. 2013)
Is debriefing effective?

- Levet-Jones & Lapkin (2014)
- 10 randomized controlled trials involving various debriefing methods were included in the review.
- Different methods of debriefing
- It is an important component of simulation and recommended to remain an integral component of all simulation-based learning experiences.
Debriefing process

- An integral and possibly the most important component of the simulation-based learning
- Theory is connected to practice and reflection, critical thinking, clinical reasoning take place and learning is maximized
- Requires a structure framework
- Facilitators require skill in diagnosing the learning needs of participants and the ability to adjust the level of facilitation needed for the group

(formal training)
PROCESS

1 2 3
Debrief Diamond: Key Phrases to Remember

Description

"So what happened? ... and then what happened next?"
Continue asking until confident that the details of the scenario have been raised by the candidates

"Let's not judge our performance now, let's just focus on what happened"

Transition

"This scenario was designed to show..."
"Let's address technical & clinical questions. What is the protocol for...?"
"How do we normally deal with this clinical situation?"
"Everyone ok with that?"

Analysis

"How did that make you feel?" To participants then group
"Why?" Then use silence

"How did you / they do that exactly?"
"Why did you respond in that way?" or "Why did you take that action?"

"It feels like... was an issue. Did it feel like that to you?"
"What I am hearing from you is... Is that correct?"

"This is part of..." (Identify the non-technical skill / human factor)
"We refer to that as a human factor or non-technical skill, which means..."

Application

"What other kinds of situations might you face that might be similar? How are they similar?"

"How might those skills we discussed play out in those situations?"

"What are you going to do differently in your practice tomorrow?"

Debrief Diamond: Underlying Principles

Description

Reinforce a safe learning environment.

Situating the debrief in the shared and meaningful activity that occurred.

Keep the focus on the case and avoid focusing on emotions.

Listen for emotional responses but resist the temptation to discuss emotions.

Make sure everyone shares the same understanding of what happened (share the mental model).

Analysis

Transition into Analysis by clarifying any technical and clinical issues

Spend most of your time in Analysis.

Deconstruct behaviour into specific actions, and explore what happened in detail.

Ask about affective responses and validate them.

Analyze and interpret the activity by applying appropriate frameworks or lenses (such as non-technical skills, or the clinical context surrounding the scenario).

Keep the discussion positive, and avoid the temptation to focus on "strengths and weaknesses".

Reflect responses back, allowing participants to amend or augment.

Application

Transition into Application by reinforcing learning

Focus on moving from the specifics of the scenario to the more general world of practice.

Break behaviours down into specific actions.

Explore the other kinds of situations that these might apply to.

Ask what participants will do differently in their practice.
Simulation and reflective thinking

- Reflection is the conscious consideration of the meaning and implication of an action
  - includes the assimilation of knowledge, skills, and attitudes with pre-existing knowledge—can lead to new interpretations
- Does not happen automatically
  - requires time, active involvement in a realistic experience, and guidance by an effective facilitator. The skills of the debriefer are important to ensure the best possible learning; Research provides evidence that the debriefing process is the most important component of a simulation-based learning experience
- Simulation-based learning experiences should include a planned debriefing session aimed toward promoting reflective thinking

Decker et al. 2013
Different methods and tools for debrief

- Different debriefing approaches have developed with little objective evidence of their effectiveness

- SHARP (Imperial College of London, 2012)
- GREAT (Owen & Follows, 2006)
- Anderson model (National League of Nursing 2008)
- Mayo Clinic model (Pivec 2011)
Fanning & Gaba 2007
- what was done correctly and what would they do differently?

Decker et al 2013, Jefferies 2010
- what went well?
- what did not go well?
- how to change?
Facilitators role in debriefing

Facilitator’s role

- Establishes and maintains an engaging learning environment
- Structures debriefing in an organized way
- Provokes engaging discussions
- Identifies and explores performance gaps
- Helps participants achieve and maintain good future performance
- Guides the conversation without lecturing
- Clarifies information
- Provides constructive feedback
- Actively listens
- Portrays a trustworthy, respectful, and positive demeanor

Student’s role

- Actively participates in all phases of simulation and debriefing
- Discuss, analyze, and summarize the experience to enhance their learning
Structured debriefing for meaningful learning

- DML, Deifuerst (2012)
- Positive influence on the development of clinical reasoning skills in undergraduate nurses.
- Guides the student through clinical reflection using a structured process of engage, evaluate, explore, explain, elaborate, and extend.
Debriefing as a part of experiential learning

- Simulation causes feelings of anxiety in the learner and it is important to create a safe environment.
- Educator has to make clear that there is an expectation of confidentiality (simulation scenarios, the participant’s actions, and debrief discussions).
- Rules of conduct must also be clear concerning constructive, honest, and respectful feedback.
- Sufficient time needs to be allocated.
- Personal responses and experiential reflections should be explored.
- Both participants and observers to be active in the debriefing.
INACLS
Criteria for debriefing

1. The debrief is facilitated by a person(s) competent in the process of debriefing
2. The debrief is conducted in an environment that is conducive to learning and supports confidentiality, trust, open communication, self-analysis, feedback, and reflection.
3. The debrief is facilitated by a person(s) who can devote enough concentrated attention during the simulation to effectively debrief the simulation-based experience.
4. The debrief is based on a theoretical framework for debriefing that is structured in a purposeful way.
5. The debrief is congruent with the objectives and outcomes of the simulation-based experience.

International Nursing Association for Clinical Simulation and Learning (INACLS) 2016
Best practice recommendations

- Integrative literature review

Eight themes emerged regarding the best practice guidelines for debrief phase in simulation-based education:
1. types of debriefing
2. debrief in simulation versus post simulation
3. environment in which the debrief takes place
4. the person who should facilitate the debrief
5. assessment and training of the person who debriefs
6. identification of the learning outcomes
7. method of debrief
8. structure of the debriefing

“What is the best practice for debriefing simulation-based education for undergraduate nursing students?”
435 abstracts → 21 articles
Results

1. Type of debriefing
   - No statistically significant difference between facilitator-only and video-assisted debriefing in achieving learning outcomes

2. Debrief in simulation versus post simulation
   - Feedback was seen as more desirable following the simulation experience

3. Environment in which the debrief takes place
   - Confidentiality, rules, safety

4. The person who should facilitate the debriefing
   - Standard practice is that the same educators observing the simulation will debrief: observing guides the facilitator on how to review actions, decisions, and judgments of the participants.
5. Training of the debrief facilitator
   - Education needed, the facilitator needs to practice in simulated environment
   - Should skills for debriefing be refined through ongoing educational activities, peer assessments, and self-education?

6. Identification of learning outcomes (LO)
   - LO set the expectations for the debrief and define the standard of performance expected
   - Need for clear objectives and increased learning when objectives are linked to students' actions in debriefing

7-8. Method of debrief and structure
   - Many models: structured framework, allow learner to progress through the identified phases
...and the best practices are...

- Debriefing is an essential component of simulation-based learning
- Facilitator-only debriefing and video-assisted debriefing can both be used as effective techniques in debriefing
- Debriefing immediately follows the simulation-based learning activity.
- A confidential safe environment is created to ensure that debriefing is effective for the learner
- The debrief facilitator receives formal training, feedback, assessment, and ongoing experience to ensure competency.
- The debriefing is facilitated by the person who observed the simulation-based activity.
- Debriefing is based on the preset learning outcomes
- Debriefing uses a structured framework
DASH- tools to develop debriefings

- A research and theory-based standard to assess educator competence in debriefing that can be applied to any style of debriefing.
- A developmental tool to guide debriefing skill acquisition via self- and peer-assessment.
- Different versions of the DASH allow educators to self-assess, provide peer-to-peer feedback, expert assessments, or allow for student assessments of debriefings.

Rudoph et al 2016
DASH elements and dimensions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Element</th>
<th>Dimensions</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
| 1. Establishes an engaging learning environment (prebriefing). | ● Clarifies course objectives, environment, confidentiality, roles, and expectations.  
● Establishes a “fiction contract” with participants.  
● Attends to logistical details.  
● Conveys a commitment to respecting learners and understanding their perspective. |
● Helps participants engage in a limited-realism context.  
● Conveys respect for learners and concern for their psychological safety. |
| 3. Structures the debriefing in an organized way. | ● Encourages learners to express their reactions and, if needed, orients them to what happened in the simulation, near the beginning.  
● Guides analysis of the learners’ performance during the middle of the session.  
● Collaborates with participants to summarize learning from the session near the end. |
| 4. Provokes engaging discussions. | ● Uses concrete examples and outcomes as the basis for inquiry and discussion.  
● Reveal own reasoning and judgments.  
● Facilitates discussion through verbal and nonverbal techniques.  
● Uses video, replay, and review devices (if available).  
● Recognizes and manages the upset participant. |
● Explores the source of the performance gap.  
● Helps close the performance gap through discussion and teaching.  
● Demonstrates firm grasp of the subject.  
● Meets the important objectives of the session. |
| 6. Helps learners achieve or sustain good future performance. | |
References


KIITOS

Eveliina Kivinen
Lahti University of Applied Sciences

eveliina.kivinen@lamk.fi
### Debriefing After Simulation

#### Appendix B: Debriefing Model

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Phase</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>Thank students for engaging in simulation and debriefing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Establish confidentiality.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State participant expectations.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State the roles of the facilitator and students.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State the process and anticipated length of the debriefing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>State the purpose of the overall simulation learning experience.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Review learning objectives.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Summarize the simulated scenario.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Discuss the rationales for why the debriefing is centered on participant analysis.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

#### Middle

**Experiencing/Concrete Experience**
- Participants fully discuss their feelings and personal reactions to the simulation experience.
- Participants should believe that their feelings have been recognized and validated.
- How do you think the simulation went?
- What and how are you feeling after this simulation? (allow role players to go and do otherwise)
- What were your favourite and least favourite aspects of the simulation?

**Reflecting/Reflective Observation**
- Participants describe and reflect on the actual events of the simulation.
- What happened?
- What do you think is going on with this patient?
- What are the primary concerns in this scenario?
- What knowledge, skills, and attitudes are useful for this simulation?
- Did you have sufficient knowledge/skills to manage this situation?
- How did the group work as a team?
- What formal agreements were needed and were they comprehensive?
- What interventions and observations were done and were they all appropriate?
- Were SIMs used when communicating with other healthcare professionals?
- Was the information gathered for the healthcare professional?