HEGEL’S NOTION OF GOTHIC ARCHITECTURE

Lino Bianco

Introduction

In an age when the ideals of the Enlightenment were giving way to the Romantic Movement’s revival of mediaeval civilisation, Gothic art was coming back into fashion. By the nineteenth century, Gothic architecture became the form of art most admired. It was regarded as an expression of the aspirations of the Christian religion and the embodiment of truly Christian values. Hegel’s philosophy and writings were produced within this context and thus ought to be read within this historical environment.

In an effort to look at Hegel’s thoughts about Gothic architecture and their limitations, this paper examines his aesthetic theory, his theory of art history and the fine arts, and ‘romantic architecture’ in the *Aesthetics*. The most important notion in Hegel’s aesthetic theory is the idea. It ‘gives art its subject matter and its meaningfulness’.¹ His philosophy of art history is based on the symbiotic relation between art and religion, intrinsic expressions of the spirit. A review of Hegel’s views about romantic architecture is also included, together with an exposition of Gothic architecture proper. By way of concluding this paper its author includes also a critique of various aspects referred to in dealing with the above themes.


Periodization of Aesthetics

In his lectures on aesthetics, Hegel develops his theories of art history and aesthetics. In earlier works, namely, the Phenomenology and the Encyclopedia, he discussed the nature of art and beauty. Art, together with religion and philosophy, are intrinsic socio-cultural expressions of spirit. Both art and religion are grounded in sensation. Hegel’s theory of art history is constructed on the relation of these two expressions. The notion that beauty is the link between the sensational and the rational, was borrowed and modified by Hegel from Schiller’s Letters on the Aesthetic Education of Mankind. Hegel argued that beauty is the ‘godlike’ rendered sensible. Beauty ‘is the perceptual presentation of what his [Hegel’s] metaphysical theory affirms to be unconditional or absolute - that ‘what is conceptual’ (that is, what is rational) is the driving force intrinsic to a self-conscious universe. ...Since... the self-conscious human being most clearly embodies this conceptual, rational principle, he concludes that the highest beauty resides in the artistically perfected appearances and actions of the rational human being’.  

Art, religion, and philosophy are the underlying fabric of any culture. They share the same human aspirations to express the unconditional and the unlimited. Their respective media are sensation, mental imagery, and pure conception. Thus, the movement from sensation to conception reflects transition from art to philosophy, via religion. This inherently Platonic theory of culture underestimated the value of sense perception in favour of pure conception. Hegel’s theory goes further than Plato’s. Hegel held that, through logic, pure concepts reveal themselves through the course of history. He believed that ‘the logic of pure thought determines the course of history’.  

History ‘is the development of Spirit in Time, just as Nature is the development of the Idea in Space’. His philosophy of history is grounded in idea, nature and

3. Ibid., 352.
spirit. The idea is the energiser behind the world. Its antithesis, namely space, is nature. Nature develops into man in whom the idea becomes conscious of itself. This self-consciousness is the spirit, the synthesis of idea and nature. The maturity of this consciousness in history. Thus, history and idea are interrelated. Now, since the idea is the nature of God’s will, then history is the reality of God. For Hegel, history is divine. Spinoza’s ‘Deus sive natura’ became for Hegel ‘Deus sive historia’. God and the world are inseparable. God would not be God if the world did not exist. God can be known through the understanding of history. History is the unfolding of God’s plan. Hegel’s view of history is essentially optimistic because, by definition, God is good.

“History, through national culture, is the process of Spirit progressing to its own self, its own cumulative concept of itself from nation to nation. Spirit is the idea concretized. Hence, the progression of historical facts is temporal and logical with respect to the self development of spirit and idea respectively. Temporary progression is of primary importance to the historian, while logical progression is primary to the philosopher. The former is keen on how the development of the idea transforms temporal to logical progression, while the latter’s interest is the transformation of logical to temporal progression.

In Hegel’s thought, history can be divided into three periods - the pre-Greek, the Greek, and the post-Greek. These correspond respectively to the symbolic, classic and romantic styles. Each period gives rise to the next. The pre-Greek is the most primitive while the post-Greek, the Christian period, is the most recent. Art,

5. Kaminsky suggests that the best way to comprehend Hegel’s notion of idea is to think of it as being analogous to Aristotle’s notion of the unmoved mover. An acorn results from an oak. To explain the change which an acorn undergoes, one must consider the oak which the acorn grows to become. The end of an oak is to make an acorn. Such ends can be traced back to one ultimate end, the unmoved mover. ‘The Unmoved Mover is the source of motion for natural objects, the Absolute Ideas is the source of motion in experience’. Thus, in Aristotelian terminology, ‘the Absolute Idea is to be equated with the efficient and final causes of all the changes in experience from infancy to maturity’, Kaminsky, Hegel on Art, 20.


8. G.W.F. Hegel, Ibid., xxix.

9. Ibid., xxiii.

10. Following from fn. 5 above, every field of knowledge is an aspect of the idea as each phase in the development of the acorn is a manifestation of the oak (Kaminsky, Hegel on Art, 20).
religion, and philosophy all progress through these periods. Art is the first to evolve followed by religion and philosophy. Art reached its climax during the Greek period while religion and philosophy did so during the Christian period.

**Theory of Art History and the Fine Arts**

Art and religion are grounded in sensation. Hegel’s theory of art history is based on the symbiotic relation between these two modes of socio-cultural expressions. Artistic expression is the form through which the ‘godlike’ is expressed. It may be more fitting for the ‘godlike’ to be expressed in one form of artistic expression rather than in another. Hegel held that only three principal artistic expressions are possible, namely, symbolic, classic, and romantic. The symbolic is the least adequate while the romantic is the most adequate form of expression. These varying forms account for the stylistic division of art history into symbolic, classic and romantic stages, characterised respectively by Ancient Egypt, Ancient Greece, and Christianity.

In comparison to later artistic expressions, the symbolic is the form through which the ‘godlike’ is expressed indirectly and approximately. What is ‘godlike’ is implied through generic conception. The ‘godlike’ was life and the elements, not human nature. In this context, a work of art vaguely abstracts, and hardly transforms and transcends the ‘godlike’. Courage may be symbolised by a lion as cowardice by a deer. Such symbols portrayed the Egyptian belief in what is ‘godlike’. Hegel observed that though symbolic art is the least effective tool to express the ‘godlike’, it sometimes attains the sublime.

The transition of Egyptian to Greek understanding of the ‘godlike’ marks the transition from the symbolic to the classic stage. Classic artistic expression is more suited to express distinctly the ‘godlike’. It has an independence and completeness that when created, ‘it seems that there is nothing more left to be done’. In Greek sculpture, the ‘godlike’ ideal is realized in material form, whether in limestone or marble, and not merely hinted at. Man was the main theme in Greek culture. A sculpture of an athlete expressed more adequately the ‘godlike’ than Egyptian

---

symbolic sculpture. Classic art transformed the generic, undetermined conception of the ‘godlike’, characteristic of symbolic art, to a more specific, anthropomorphic one. Similar to the former transition from Egyptian to Greek conception of the ‘godlike’, the transition from Greek to Christian understanding of the ‘godlike’ marks the transition from the classic to the romantic stage. The emergence of Christianity transformed the Greek conception of the ‘godlike’ into an interpersonal, intangible conception. The proportioned, well built athlete was no longer the object of admiration. Christianity rendered the living presence of human beings into merely souls alien to the physical bodies which house them. The soul is the inner character of a human being. It is immortal. The body, together with sense perception, were put aside as mere objects of contempt. Hence, the dimension that made it possible for the Greek religious beliefs to be harmonised and be in phase with what is ‘godlike’, is no longer present. Christianity emphasized the subjective freedom and the unlimited value of individualism. When self and inner life are considered of such value, ‘the forms of art must move on from balance and harmony to the storm and turmoil of the subjective’. Subjectivity and individual consciousness are attained in romantic art. Thus, Christianity distinctly belongs to the romantic style - a style where artistic expression aims at reaching deeper into the inner nature of man’s subjectivity. The romantic style is the peak of ideal artistic expression. As an artistic expression, romantic art is more profound than symbolic art because the thought process underlying it is more refined and developed. Although, prima facie, such forms of art seem similar, the mind of ‘romantic’ man is more complex than that of ‘symbolic’ or ‘classic’ man.

The symbolic, classic, and romantic styles are expressed through art history, through the various forms of artistic expressions. The system of arts in the eighteenth and early nineteenth century was based on the five fine arts. Architecture is one of these five arts, the others being sculpture, painting, music and poetry. Hegel adopted this system of classifying the arts in his philosophy of art. His three theses were stated by Wicks thus:

Thesis 1: ‘Art’s prime subject matter historically develops from sensuous conceptions to non-sensuous conceptions’;

Thesis 2: ‘Art in general grows, flourishes, and declines in accord with the historical development from sensuous to non-sensuous conceptions’;

12. Ibid.
Thesis 3: ‘Each individual art grows, flourishes and declines in accord with the historical development from sensuous to non-sensuous conceptions of the divine’.

With respect to each fine art, Hegel inquired whether the particular medium was able to express metaphysical knowledge in a form adequate to such knowledge itself and in a sensory form.\textsuperscript{14}

Each individual art may be produced in either one of the three styles. Hegel held that, while painting, music, and poetry are appropriate to the romantic style, architecture and sculpture are more appropriate to the symbolic and classic style respectively. Thus, architecture attains its ideal form during the symbolic stage. Architecture is the first and most inadequate product of art. The limited purpose of architecture, together with building construction, hinder it from the ability to express fully the ‘godlike’. Gravity and solidity - the essentials of building construction - are too basic and mechanical to reflect the nature of the ‘godlike’ in any particular way. Architecture is external and impersonal. It does not transform or transcend to express the ‘godlike’.\textsuperscript{15}

\textbf{Romantic Architecture in the Aesthetics}

Gothic architecture is the centre of Romantic style. Hegel acknowledges Goethe’s contribution in bringing this architecture to ‘honour’.\textsuperscript{16} In his chapter on ‘Romantic Architecture’, Hegel deals with the general character of Romantic architecture, the

\textsuperscript{14} Ibid., 365.

\textsuperscript{15} Hegel further argues that the limited purposes of architecture do not correspond to art’s principal task (Wicks, “Hegel’s Aesthetics”, 356)

\textsuperscript{16} A dimension to Hegel’s concern with Gothic is Goethe. Goethe’s writings on Gothic architecture were known to Hegel both for their focus on Gothic architecture per se, as for their elucidation of the concept of romanticism in relation to this form of architecture. Hegel was certainly aware of the way late Goethe came to sell Romantic style. Early Goethe despised romantic attitude to life in favour of a classical one: ‘Classical, to me means healthy, and romantic means sick... Most of what is new is not romantic because it is new, but because it is weak and sickly and ailing. And what is old is not classical because it is old, but because it is strong, fresh, joyful and healthy’ (“Conversations with Eckermann”, 2 April 1829, as reproduced in N. Pevsner, \textit{Studies in Art, Architecture and Design} Vol. 1, (Thames and Hudson; London 1969) 171.
particular architectural formations, and the different styles in Romantic architecture. The general character of building types in Romantic style is ecclesiastical. In this context, architecture is specifically for a particular, well-defined need. ‘It has and displays a definite purpose; but in its grandeur and sublime peace it is lifted above anything purely utilitarian into an infinity in itself. This elevation above the finite and this simple solidity, is its one characteristic aspect’.

Under the heading of ‘Particular Architectural Formations’, Hegel considers the fully enclosed house as the fundamental form, the form of the interior and the exterior, and finally, the mode of decorating. The enclosure is intended to create a place of worship away from the distraction of the material world. The basic form of Romantic architectural construction is characterised by pitched roofs rather than the post and lintel, the classic solution.

The Gothic interior is a complete enclosure for the spirit. The form of the interior is determined by dimensions and their character. Walls are high and columns are slender. Their structural purpose of carrying the load from the roof to the ground, though readable, is not emphasized. Furthermore, the pointed arch gives columns, in particular, different form and purpose.

“The interior glints... through the shape of the exterior and determines its form and arrangement in detail’. The exterior envelopes the interior. In Gothic architecture, the exterior is characterised by verticality. The external form, including decoration, is “determined from within outwards, since the exterior is to appear as only an enclosing of the interior’. External form reflects the interior with respect to the separation of the various parts forming the church, especially emphasized by their respective heights.

In Romantic architecture, the main purpose of decoration ‘is not to destroy or conceal the outlines by the mass and diversity of ornamentation but to let them, as the essential thing on which all depends, permeate this variety through and through

18. Ibid., 685.
19. Ibid., 687.
20. Ibid., 693.
and completely'. Decoration in this style gives maximum sense of lightness and grace known through history. Forms of decoration are essentially simple and organic in origin. Pointed arches, columns, and circles may be the exception. When Gothic was at its best, simple organic forms were also preserved in decoration, say, of pointed arched windows.

The different styles which Hegel identifies in Romantic architecture are the Romanesque, Gothic, and secular architecture. Romanesque architecture is pre-Gothic. It originated from pagan Roman buildings. Gothic architecture proper knows its origin in the thirteenth century. Its association with Arabic architecture in Spain is denied. Besides the fact that Gothic and Arabic buildings are different due to the different religions in which they respectively sprang up, Gothic architecture is characterised by the pointed arch while Arabic architecture is characterised by the horse shoe arch. In secular architecture, 'walls, doors, towers, bridges, etc., are dictated by need and are decorated and beautified by art'. Such architecture has to fulfil a number of needs. Utility is the main parameter determining the architecture, aesthetic being secondary. Art is therefore mere decoration.

**Gothic Architecture**

It was only in the eighteenth century that Gothic architecture started to be taken seriously. The strong desire of late eighteenth century Christians to rediscover and return to traditional Christian values exemplified in the Gothic style led to the reconsideration of the arts of the Gothic period. Due to the lack of sound theoretical grounding of this architectural style, many efforts were made to investigate and sell the style. Some of the ideas generated were quasi mythical. Such was the idea developed by Worbutom, a bishop in the mid-eighteenth century. He held that

21. Ibid., 696.

22. The term Romanesque was first applied to eleventh and twelfth century architecture in 1819 by Gunn and de Gerville. Since then, the term Gothic has been used only with its contemporary meaning. It was in this sense that Hegel used the term in his *Aesthetics*.


Hegel was well aware that Gothic is essentially an ecclesiastical style. It is worth noting that this section is about secular architecture of the Gothic period rather than about secular Gothic Architecture. For the distinction between terms see P. Frankl, "Gothic Architecture", in *Encyclopedia Britannica*, vol. 10, (William Benton; London 1964) 604.
since the Goths were used to worship in sacred groves, they built churches which looked like an avenue of trees. Although this presumed origin of Gothic architecture is historically unfounded, the link which it suggested between Gothic and nature was of significant value to eighteenth century thought. Though frequently speculative and vague, the contribution of eighteenth century enthusiasts to the quest of Gothic culture, in particular its architecture, is impressive. Serious investigation of the topography and history of the style began in the nineteenth century.\(^{24}\) Hegel can be perceived as one of the pioneers who was seriously and professionally struggling to give a philosophical basis to Gothic style as manifested in the five fine arts popular at his time.

The Gothic style gave Christianity a distinctive architecture. It remained distinctively Christian. Its original meaning was lost with time until its renaissance brought about by the romantic revival. The language used in describing Gothic dates back to 1817 when Rickman, a chemist by profession, gave a descriptive analysis of Gothic in terms of its vocabulary, namely, portals, windows, arches, piers, buttresses, etc.\(^{25}\) On the stylistic transformations of these members, he identified various phases in the evolution of the English Gothic. Hegel noted that several important innovations helped overcome the problem of giving the impression of great height. These are the use of the groined vault with pointed arch, the use of the flying buttress, and the emphasis on vertical rather than horizontal features.\(^{26}\) Pointed arches made interiors seem larger. Furthermore, the pointed arch, coupled with slender piers, caused the eye to raise upwards. 'The pointed form of the windows, the spires, the towers, and the buttresses with their gables and pinnacles all contribute to the impression of great heights reaching into infinity.'\(^{27}\) These ideas of Hegel were popular at his time. In 1835, Wetter, in a footnote in a guide to Mainz Cathedral, stated four main architectural features of Gothic churches, namely, the pier, buttressing system, the pointed arch, and the ribbed vault.\(^{28}\) These relate to

---

24. By this time, scholars were aware that the adjective Gothic bears historically no reference to the Goths.

25. Frankl, "Gothic Architecture", 598


27. Ibid., 60.


Ribs were accepted and their potential exploited, because the culture at the time accepted the belief that the individual is part of a transcendent whole, a fragment of the universe and of infinity (Ibid., 605).
the stylistic elements of slenderness of columns, disappearance of walls, verticality, and structural roofing solution respectively.

Hegel’s discussion of Gothic architecture is more profound than these observations. He argues that such architecture can only be appreciated by individuals who are conscious of the philosophical leap from Greek to Christian thought. To the Christian, God is perfect and rational. Man is full of desires and passions. He is suffering the consequences of original sin and struggling to attain, after his death, access to eternal life. The Gothic ideal man was the suffering Christ.²⁹ For the Greeks, rational man, free from desires and passions, was the ideal. The Christian finds in Gothic architecture a symbol which personified his desires to move upwards to a higher truth.³⁰ Symbolism is best signified in Gothic architecture. Historically, the Gothic style was already at its peak when the fine arts started to be integrated with the architecture which they intended to embellish.

**Final Comments**

The movement from sensation to conception inspired the progression from art to religion to philosophy and from symbolic to classic to romantic. Culture progresses from sensation to mental imagery to pure conceptions, while art history progresses from a style which is hardly subjective to a highly complex subjective one. Similarly, the artistic media of fine arts progress from three-dimensional to two-dimensional and finally to non-spatial ones.

Hegel’s theory of art history and the fine arts is defined by two structural patterns - a linear development pattern and a pattern of ‘growth and decline’ which is partly developmental and partly retrogressive.³¹ With respect to the limitations of Hegel’s aesthetic theory, Wicks puts forward various arguments.³² The arguments worth mentioning are the following: Hegel’s theory was based on the ‘five fine arts’.  

²⁹. P. Frankl, *The Gothic: Literary Sources and Interpretations* (Princeton 1960). In this work, mainly concerned with Gothic architecture, Frankl holds that the person of the suffering Christ was the Gothic man’s model.

³⁰. Gothic architecture always leads one’s mind to a higher reality, namely, God.

³¹. Wicks, “Hegel’s Aesthetics”, 372 and 373.

³². Ibid., 371.
Since the nineteenth century, the system of classifying the arts was drastically expanded. For the theory to be valid, it ‘must be flexible enough to maintain an expression to accommodate new and previously undervalued arts’. Furthermore, the theory is concerned not with aesthetic criteria but with artistic beauty. Hegel’s metaphysics of self-consciousness is highly questioned and thus his reasons for believing that art is the medium for metaphysical knowledge are doubtful. Also, his tripartite division of history of art is too simplistic. Finally, one may question Hegel’s thesis whether choosing the appropriate subject matter of an artwork does have any bearing on the artwork’s aesthetic value. A number of critics argue that the converse is true.

Hegel’s notions of periodization and his categories of periodic time are central to his philosophical thought. History is a temporal thing, unfolding in time. He assesses events in the past in order to show their relevance to the present and the future. His approach is teleological since historical events are assessed and interpreted not with respect to their own time but in terms of what happened later. It is nonsense to speak of Caesar’s invasion of England in this sense because at the time of the invasion, Caesar had no knowledge of what was to happen later. Also, the notions of symbolic, classic, and romantic are used in different ways. They are both media and phases. As phases, reference to the notion of time is clear: The three distinctive categories of architectural history are symbolic architecture, classic architecture, and romantic architecture. Architecture is most adequately suited for the less adequate stage of artistic expression, namely, the symbolic stage. Each architectural phase corresponds to a historical expression of the symbolic art of architecture dominant at the time. Hence, romantic architecture is the romantic expression of the symbolic art of architecture.

The greatness of romantic style cannot make up for the limitations of architecture as a form of art. Kaminsky argues that architecture can never be as important to art as the contents which it encloses. Bound by materialism, architectural forms can never have a deep insight as that present in sculpture and painting. ‘Architecture can at most suggest life and power... Architecture can only express divinity as an abstract intangible Being’. In this sense the romantic style cannot make good for the limitations inherent to architecture.

33. Ibid., 371.
The tripartite structure of Hegel’s thought, whether with respect to his aesthetic theory (art-religion-philosophy) or his theory of art history (symbolic-classic-romantic), is not new to Western thought. Since ancient times, philosophy was always conceived as based on a tripartite structure. Aristotle classified sciences in terms of theoretical, practical and productive, while the Stoics divided philosophy into physics, ethics and logic. Kant has three critiques - the critique of pure reason, the critique of practical reason, and the critique of judgment. Furthermore, Hegel’s association of the natural with the more primitive and less profound, was not original. Laugier had made such an association several decades earlier. So were Hegel’s concepts of the beautiful and the sublime and their identification with the classic and non-classic respectively. In 1768, Gilpin had already associated Gothic with the aspiration of man towards the sublime and the unlimited. Since the nineteenth century, scholars have been arguing whether Gothic ‘Zeitgeist’ manifested itself in all fields.

The Gothic revival in architecture fostered German enthusiasm for a national Christian architecture. Enthusiasm ran so high that Cologne Cathedral was completed in the nineteenth century according to the original plans of the thirteenth century. In this context one may read Hegel as an architect devising a philosophy for the strong Prussian State. Nationalism in Prussia was at its peak especially in confrontation with France. For Goethe, Gothic was German. With reference to Strasbourg Cathedral’s west facade, Goethe states that ‘This is German architecture, this is ours… quickening out of the strong, rough German soul’. Hegel’s

35. The Anthropology, the fourth critique, is actually an integration of these three critiques.
37. Although Gilpin’s, metaphysically supported, grounding of Gothic was of great significance, the pointed arch continued to remain the main diagnostic feature of this style (Frankl, “Gothic Architecture”, 598).
38. Goethe’s Von deutscher Baukunst (1772) is partly aimed at addressing the French rationalist architectural theorist Laugier’s publications of 1753 and 1765 which included a discussion on the development of Gothic. The arguments and judgments on the evolution of Gothic put forward by Laugier are more rational and objective than Goethe’s. His attitude and approach to judging Gothic architecture changed significantly as is evident in his essay of 1823 bearing the same title of his 1772 work.
philosophy, as with the architecture of Schinkel, may be read as an expression of the strong authoritarian Prussian State. For Hegel, Prussia was not the absolute culmination of world-historical process. It was only relative. In America he saw 'the land of the future'. In the Prussian State of his time, the existing spirit is the relative and not absolute reality of the spirit. Thus, within this context, Hegel's spirit is best read as the spirit of the age.

In Popperian terminology, Hegel, the background to early Marx, is totalitarian. The human subject is conditioned and determined by circumstances in which he/she is nurtured. Thus, why have theorists nowadays turned again to Hegel? This may be due to the renewed interest in individualism and human subjectivity, a way of thinking of the individual in non-totalitarian terms. Determinism in history, or the 'wickedness of Hegel in Carr's terms, influenced rigorous art-historical scholarship. Most of Hegel is in Mies van der Rohe's theory and notion of architecture.

“Pia Camilla”
E.B. Vella Str.,
B’Kara BKR 12
Malta

40. G.W.F. Hegel, *Reason in History*, xiv

41. Hegel's philosophy is totalitarian although not as much as it is often portrayed. Certainly, besides influencing Marxist totalitarian regimes, Hegel’s philosophy influenced Whitman, the forerunner of American democracy.