

*PEACEBUILDING IN KARACHI, PAKISTAN: TO
COUNTER HATE, SUSPICION AND
INTOLERANCE AN ARTIST COLLECTIVE LEADS*

The potential nexus between arts-informed research
and resilience programming.

Sarosh Hussain

September 26, 2019



L-Università
ta' Malta

University of Malta Library – Electronic Thesis & Dissertations (ETD) Repository

The copyright of this thesis/dissertation belongs to the author. The author's rights in respect of this work are as defined by the Copyright Act (Chapter 415) of the Laws of Malta or as modified by any successive legislation.

Users may access this full-text thesis/dissertation and can make use of the information contained in accordance with the Copyright Act provided that the author must be properly acknowledged. Further distribution or reproduction in any format is prohibited without the prior permission of the copyright holder.

ABSTRACT

Circa 2010 to 2015, Karachi Pakistan: the weaponization of visual narrative (wall-chalking/graffiti) exacerbated ethno-political tension, inter-and-intra religious conflict and provided non-state actors and extremists groups with a canvas to propagate messages of hate, suspicion and intolerance. Research suggests that political stabilization efforts and resilience programs yield positive results when dovetailed with a counter narrative communications campaign.

This study aims to determine the social and political impact of the Walls of Peace public space counter narrative campaign. Given that professional artist led this resilience activity; what were their methods of research, how did they operationalize and execute an activity on such a large scale? How did the public respond to their intervention?

Based on the social, political and geographical complexity of the activity, literature was reviewed, theories were assessed, interviews were conducted and data was gathered. The findings indicate that artists' methods of research are rigorous, iterative, immersive, social and communal, however their practice is unfamiliar to development practitioners and policy makers. Also, due to the counter visual narrative intervention a physical, political, and emotional change did occur throughout Karachi. According to survey responses a positive shift occurred in Karachiites towards hope and pride. Further research is needed to identify co-creation opportunities amongst artists and development practitioners to address broader salient development issues.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

A number of individuals directly or indirectly supported my path for higher learning. My gratitude specifically extends to my immediate family. First and foremost, thanks to my brother Zeeshan for his constant push for me to personally and professionally better myself. Your support has been critical to my success with this endeavor. Thanks bro! Second, my mother who has been a constant presence in my life. Your delivery of love never goes unnoticed. Thirdly, my brother Sajeel, who unknowingly inspired me to proceed with this degree. The perseverance he exhibited in obtaining a bachelor's degree later in life was helpful in my decision to keep driving forward. Lastly, my father who set numerous positive examples of how to traverse life, which I am only beginning to understand now. Much Love.

Mani Hussain

Mary, Sebastian, Oliver and Manal Hussain – Thank you!

Tariq, Julie, Tahir, Shahid Hussain and Pervais Bhai

Javaid and Nadeem Mamou

Kameron Bess | George Higginbotham | Adeela Suleman

Dr. Suleman and Raani Ante

Dr. Julie Shedd | Dr. Omar Grech | the 2018 GMU SCAR Malta Cohort

Scott Nelavanko | the Was' | the Moore's | the Ashley's | the Webster's | Alexis Norton & Mark

Wilkins | Matt Goodspeed | Shawn Huddleston | Scott Elder | Dave Robertshaw

John Thompson | Dave Overton | Debbie Moser | Amy Elliott | Dan Fike

Ricardo Michel | Stephanie Bluma | Tom Carter | Evan Papp | Samuel Bishop | Cecelia Brady

Ticora Jones | Beth Cole | Ali Curtis

Ashani Alles | Braden Belmonte & the NYC Posse | Jonas Steadman | Keith Robinson | Hira

Khan | Morgana Wingard | Sophie Smith | the Doctors House (Sri Lanka) | Andrew Freiband |

Ayesha Khwaja | Arianna Dicapua | Sonal Sheth

Benjamin – Clutch – Parke

ACRONYMS

AIRM	arts-informed research methods
ALI	Artist Literacies Institute
ANP	Awami National Party
CSO	civil society organization
CVE	countering violent extremism
DFID	Department for International Development
EPI	Everyday Peace Indicators
HCD	Human Centered Design
INGO	international non-governmental organizations
IVSAA	Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture
MQM	Muttahida Qaumi Movement
NGO	non-governmental organization
OTI	Office of Transition Initiatives
PIPS	Pakistan Institute of Peace Studies
PPP	Pakistan People's Party
PVE	preventing violent extremism
RISD	Rhode Island School of Design
SIDA	Swedish International Development Agency
STEAM	Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts Mathematics
ToC	Theory of Change
TTP	Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan
USAID	United States Agency for International Development
VE	Violent Extremism

Table of Contents

ABSTRACT.....	1
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	2
ACRONYMS.....	3
CHAPTER ONE INTRODUCTION.....	6
CHAPTER TWO LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK	11
2.1 INTRODUCTION.....	11
2.2 ARTS-INFORMED RESEARCH METHODS	12
2.2.1 VISUAL NARRATIVE	14
2.2.2 STEAM AND HUMAN CENTERED DESIGN.....	16
2.3 CVE AND RESILIENCE PROGRAMMING	17
2.3.1 STRATEGIC COMMUNICATION INTERVENTION FRAMEWORK	19
2.4 THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK & THEORY OF CHANGE.....	22
2.5 EVERYDAY PEACE INDICATORS.....	24
2.6 SYNTHESIS, ANALYSIS & GAPS	25
2.7 CONCLUSION	26
CHAPTER THREE METHODOLOGY	27
3.1 INTRODUCTION.....	27
3.2 RESEARCH PHILOSOPHY	27
3.3 RESEARCH APPROACH: QUALITATIVE.....	28
3.4 RESEARCH METHOD	29
3.5 INTERVIEWS	30
3.6 OBSERVATION	31
3.7 DATA COLLECTION METHOD	32
3.8 DATA ANALYSIS	33
3.9 ETHICAL CONSIDERATIONS	34
3.10 RESEARCH LIMITATIONS.....	36
3.11 CONCLUSION	36

CHAPTER FOUR | FINDINGS 37

4.1 | INTRODUCTION..... 38
4.2 | INSECURITY DRIVERS 40
4.3 | WEAPONIZATION OF VISUAL NARRATIVE 46
4.4 | RESEARCH METHODS 49
4.5 | INTERVENTION 52
4.6 | PUBLIC RESPONSE..... 59
4.7 | NOTABLE CONCERNS..... 62
4.8 | SUMMARY OF FINDINGS..... 65

CHAPTER FIVE | DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION 68

5.1 | INTRODUCTION..... 68
5.2 | INTERPRETATION OF FINDINGS 69
5.2.1 | SECURITY DRIVERS..... 70
5.2.2 | VISUAL NARRATIVE 70
5.2.3 | RESEARCH METHODS 71
5.2.4 | INTERVENTION 71
5.2.5 | PUBLIC RESPONSE..... 73
5.2.6 | NOTABLE CONCERNS..... 73
5.3 | IMPLICATIONS OF THEORY AND RESEARCH 74
5.4 | LIMITATIONS OF RESEARCH..... 75
5.5 | RECOMMENDATIONS 76
5.6 | CONCLUSION 77

BIBLIOGRAPHY 80

CHAPTER ONE | INTRODUCTION

This research study examines the Walls of Peace grant activity in Karachi, Pakistan. The activity was funded by the United States Agency for International Development (USAID) to support political stabilization efforts, counter violent extremism (CVE) and promote local level community based resilience. Beginning in 2014, and led by a professional cadre of artist, The Walls of Peace counter narrative campaign positioned a visual strategy depicting messages of pride, hope ownership and diversity in order to counter the messages of hate, division and intolerance on Karachi walls. The primary aim of this qualitative research study was to inquire and question what change, if any, resulted from this essential hearts and minds counter narrative activity. A secondary objective of this study was to determine if arts-informed research could be of further value to development practitioners whom assess and design development intervention programs for complex social, political and cultural environments.

Violence in Karachi, circa 2010 to 2015, was frequent, gruesome, and in many cases discriminate. The rise in violence can be linked to ethno-political tension amongst Karachi's mostly homogenous ethnic groups; physical and psychological intimidation of religious and ethnic minorities; kidnappings, target killings, drug smuggling and extortion linked to organized crime syndicates, and the on-going War on Terror¹. The ubiquity and labyrinth of Karachi's city walls provided the perfect medium for ethno-political, religious and extremists groups to recruit, divide, intimidate and spread messages of fear and hate.

¹ Zia Ur Rehman, "Pakistan Security Report. Chapter 6: Killings in Karachi: Down, but Not Out" (Pak Institute for Peace Studies (PIPS), 2016).

The elephant in the room during this time of crises was the United States. Regionally, the War on Terror was being waged in Afghanistan. America's bi-lateral foreign assistance to Pakistan can be bifurcated into two period segments. The first significant tranche of military and development assistance can be directly linked to the 1979 Soviet invasion of Afghanistan. The second significant tranche of military and development assistance was a direct result of 9/11 and the War on Terror. Over a period of five years from 2009 to 2013, Pakistan received on average per year, 1.5 Billion USD in non-military U.S. foreign assistance due to the Enhanced Partnership with Pakistan Act, 2009². The appropriation of funds were regulated to the following development sectors: Democracy and Governance, Economic Growth, Education, Health, Agriculture and Food Security, Capacity Building, Security and Gender Equality³.

Peace and security are elusive to Pakistan. The nation's enemies are internal as well as external. To the east, India poses an on-going security risk related to the Kashmir dispute. To the west, an untrusting Afghan central government is suspect of Pakistan's ability to reign in jihadi elements ideologically connected to the Taliban.

Internal violence can be attributed to ethnic division, political dysfunction, inter and intra-religious tension, extremist ideology and the lack of basic human needs. The 2017 Asia Foundation report on the State of Conflict and Violence in Pakistan posits that over 40 terrorists groups operate within its borders. The following excerpt provides a snapshot of political and extremist violence in 2013:

“Terrorist attacks and violent clashes among different political parties during the 2013 general elections led to 298 deaths and 885 injuries

² “Text of S. 962 (111th): Enhanced Partnership with Pakistan Act of 2009 (Passed the Senate Version),” GovTrack.us, accessed September 25, 2019, <https://www.govtrack.us/congress/bills/111/s962/text>.

³ “Text of S. 962 (111th).”

between January 1 and May 15 of that year. The province of Sindh—primarily Karachi—was the most affected by both terrorist attacks and incidents of political violence, followed by KP and Balochistan. A total of 148 terrorist attacks were reported across Pakistan in that four-and-a-half-month period, targeting political leaders, offices, and rallies, election candidates, and polling stations. Of the 148 attacks, 108 were perpetrated by the Tehreek-e-Taliban Pakistan (TTP) and its local affiliates, killing 156 people and injuring 665. Baloch nationalist insurgents were responsible for 40 attacks, which killed 14 and injured 78. The ANP and the PPP were targeted in almost every region of Pakistan, while the MQM was primarily attacked in Karachi. The 2013 elections demonstrated the lengths to which militant groups would go to manipulate political outcomes through violence, targeting secularist parties, such as the PPP, ANP, and MQM, who formed the last government⁴.”

Karachi is colossal, vibrant, diverse and at times extremely dangerous. Situated on the coast of the Indian Ocean, Karachi is the commercial, industrial and financial hub of Pakistan. The mega-city has an official population of just over 16 million people⁵. Karachi ethnic groups consist of Muhajirs, Pashtuns, Saraikis, Punjabis, Baloch, and Sindhi. Sunni Muslims are the majority and religious minorities consist of Shi’a, Christian, Hindu, Ahmadis, Parsis, Sikhs, Bahias, Jews and Buddhists⁶. Lloyd’s city-risk index states that Karachi’s share of annual Gross Domestic Product

⁴ “Pakistan - State of Conflict and Violence” (Asia Foundation, 2017), <https://asiafoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Pakistan-StateofConflictandViolence.pdf>.

⁵ “PAKISTAN TEHSIL WISE FOR WEB CENSUS_2017.Pdf,” n.d.

⁶ “Pakistan - State of Conflict and Violence.”

(GDP) is 16.23%⁷, however, various publications estimate the actual contribution to be in the range of 20 to 25% of Pakistan's total GDP.

The economic and political importance of Karachi is evident. Therefore, mitigating ethno-political tension, inter-and-intra religious conflict and pacify non-state actors and extremists groups was a top priority. Upon learning that an artist collective was leading a CVE/Resilience activity the researcher inquired further:

- a) What role did the artist collective precisely play in the overall CVE/Resilience strategy, if any at all?
- b) How did they plan and execute the activity? Did the activity achieve its desired impact on Karachi's ethnic, political and religious divide or shift the hearts and minds of Karachiites?
- c) If successful, what did they do differently? Was success attributed to their unique position as artists? How did they define and measure success? Or, was the activity a failure?

Could the findings of this research further assist or enhance CVE/Resilience assessment, design and impact? If yes, can artist methods of research be institutionalized within the donor community?

Prior research for this topic is fragmented, therefore the Chapter 2 literature review discusses arts-informed research methods, the impact of visual narrative in relation to frames of reference, Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts Mathematics (STEAM) and Human Centered Design, CVE and Resilience programming frameworks, strategic communications and the theoretical

⁷ "Lloyd's City Risk Index 2015-2025: Analyzing the Economic Exposure from 18 Threats over Ten Years from 2015" (Lloyd's, November 24, 2016), www.lloyds.com/cityriskindex.

framework of this study. Perhaps the literature review can provide a deeper understanding of Karachi's ethnic, political and religious problem sets and the subsequent intervention response.

Chapter 3 methodology section presents the process of research that was undertaken to compile this study. The philosophical grounding of this study is centered on Interpretivism epistemology and constructivist ontology. The researcher traveled to Karachi, Pakistan to interview stakeholders, implementers, and the artists who directly participated in the activity. The researcher gathered his data via participant interviews, observations, project documents, journals, articles and on-line news sources.

Chapter 4 presents the study's findings. The section unpacks the activity design, implementation, research methods, weaponization of visual narrative and the intervention. The chapter also conveys testimonials of the public in response to the intervention, while noting notable concerns voiced by project participants. It is also underpins the theory of change applied by members of the art collective. The chapter ends with a summary of findings.

Chapter 5 completes this study with an interpretation of the findings, implications pertaining to the research, limitations the researcher encountered, recommendation for consideration and a brief conclusion.

The phenomenon of wall-chalking/graffiti weaponized narrative affected the daily lives of Karachiites. The study examines the methodology, purpose and professional skillset of artist that directly intervened in Karachi's complex ethnic, political and religious conflict. The following section reflects on the body of knowledge surrounding the issues topical areas discussed thus far.

CHAPTER TWO | LITERATURE REVIEW AND THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

"Every place where is revolt, there's art, because art always conveys the message of people," said JR⁸.

2.1 | Introduction

Chapter 2 explores published literature pertaining to arts-informed research methods (AIRM) and CVE/Resilience programming. In the researchers attempt to be thorough this literature review covers a broad base of information related to the various elements involving the case study. Section 2.2 will first examine the conceptual and applied underpinnings of arts-informed research methods within the context of qualitative research. Sub-section 2.2.1 will discuss visual narrative, frames of reference and societal impact. Moreover, authors discuss two muralists whom have influenced and impacted public opinion through with their public works. Sub-section 2.2.2 briefly explores STEAM (Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts, and Mathematics) and Human Centered Design (HCD) as pedagogical cohorts to Arts-Informed Research. Section 2.3 assesses the methodology and application of CVE/Resilience programs. Related to CVE/Resilience, sub-section 2.3.1 covers lessoned learned from field deployment of strategic communication strategies. Sub-section 2.4 delves into the theoretical framework and the underpinning Theory of Change (ToC) related to this study. Sub-section 2.5 survey Everyday Peace Indicators and their applicability to field activities. Sub-section 2.6 discusses literature analysis, synthesis and gaps with sub-section 2.7 concluding this chapter.

⁸"In Wake of Protests, French Artist JR Pushes Hong Kong to Embrace Graffiti," Dow Jones Institutional News; New York, March 17, 2015, <http://search.proquest.com/docview/2069109164/citation/B4EDBD4E613542FDPQ/1>.

2.2 | Arts-Informed Research Methods

Visual artists draw, paint, illustrate or photograph their physical environment. Performative artists produce dance, perform theater and standup comedy. The written arts generate play writing, written prose or poetry. From the production of film and digital video, to the composition of a music score, to the painting of frescos; artist employ an emotional immersive process-oriented method of rigorous research to better inform their body of knowledge prior to producing their art.

In the Sage Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Arts-Informed Research, authors Knowles and Cole, deconstruct arts-informed research methods as a qualitative approach to social science. The methodology combines languages, process, and literary, visual and performing arts for the advancement of knowledge, rooted in the human experience⁹. The authors go on to state that artist employ multidimensional methods to engage the world around them - physical, emotional, spiritual, social, and cultural - by accessing the oral, literal, visual, and embodied¹⁰. Furthermore, Knowles and Cole convey that arts-informed research can be employed as a methodological tool when conducting arts-informed life history study, an arts-informed phenomenological inquiry, an arts-informed narrative inquiry, or an arts-informed ethnography¹¹.

In A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research, author Maggi Savin-Baden builds upon Knowles and Cole. Ms. Savin-Baden states that the artist researcher during the analytic process plays the lead in inquiry, especially if the inquiry is along the same medium the artist is skilled in. Therefore,

⁹J. Gary Knowles and Ardra L. Cole, The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Arts-Informed Research (2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008), <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909>.

¹⁰Knowles and Cole.

¹¹Knowles and Cole.

the artist reflexive process incorporates data from diary notes, creative expression, artifacts, and narratives revealed by way of inquiry¹². Ms. Savin-Baden goes on to imply that artist life experience is brought forth through identity, research position, and rigor in order to properly inquire, think, problem solve, and create. She explains further, “the arts, in the broadest sense, are to explore, understand and represent human action and experience. It has emerged as a concept and practice from the interaction between art and social science.¹³” And in reference to formal pedagogical ways of learning, Savin-Bader communicates that an ongoing tug of war is occurring between the “qualitative tradition of developing methods, building theories and models to enhance research practice that is theoretically and methodologically robust; and the desire for arts-related research to remain undefined, non-paradigmatic and discipline-less.¹⁴” Finally, she conveys that traditional forms of qualitative research methods are by way of action research, grounded theory, participant observation, and reflective practice¹⁵.

The Artist Literacies Institute (ALI) based in Brooklyn, New York delves deeper into the practical application of arts-informed research, or as ALI categorizes it, artist literacies. ALI summarizes that artist gather data and evidence through the use of sight, smell, hearing, taste, touch, observation, interactive critical dialogue and social engagement in examining complex systems¹⁶. Further, ALI posits that artist are uniquely positioned by way of their training to have the ability to discover politics, culture, counter-culture, pop-culture, conflict, race, class, gender, traditions,

¹²Maggi Savin-Baden, *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research* (Rotterdam: Sense, 2014).

¹³“Savin-Baden - 2014 - A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research. Pdf,” n.d. Introduction p. 1

¹⁴“Savin-Baden - 2014 - A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research. Pdf.” *Critical Turn Three: Arts related research as Evolving Inquiry* p.23

¹⁵Savin-Baden, *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research*, 23.

¹⁶Andrew Freiband, “Artists Literacies Institute,” *Artists’ Literacies Institute*, accessed August 01, 2019, <https://www.artistsliteracies.org/about-us>.

norms, and life-histories¹⁷. Moreover, because artists are social beings, they have the ability to access deep-seated emotions, learn directly from their access to networks and local communities.

Knowles, Cole and Savin-Bader appear to be signaling to their social science colleagues that the chasm is not so wide between the qualitative research tradition of social scientists and arts-informed research methods. Advocates for arts-informed research are positioning their methods to be multidimensional, immersive and rigorous.

2.2.1 | Visual Narrative

From billboard advertisements to street graffiti or revolutionary murals to public space exhibitions; visual narrative depicts a story. The psychological influence of visual narrative upon the public can be ephemeral; however it can have lasting effects. Visual narrative can be positive, neutral or negative when projected, absorbed and processed by various segments of a society; morning, day and night.

According to Mannay, society interprets the visual narrative based upon frames of experience and knowledge¹⁸. The author further explains the parameters, in which, visual narrative “evokes memory, reflection and feelings, however, interpretation and process depend on accrued cultural knowledge that experience imposes on frames of reference¹⁹.

Two artists that have had significant and long-lasting effects in relation to frames of experience and knowledge²⁰ are Mr. Rivera and Mr. Alkhas.

¹⁷ Freiband.

¹⁸Dawn Mannay, *Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods: Application, Reflection and Ethics*, 1st ed. (Routledge, 2015), 64, <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315775760>.

¹⁹Mannay.

²⁰Mannay.

Author Rubayan-Ling discusses how the renowned communist Mexican muralist Diego Rivera of the Mexican Mural Movement was commissioned during the Great Depression to paint two large frescos in Henry Ford's capitalist Detroit (final work consisted of 27 panels). Mr. Rivera conducted a two-month methodical walk through of factories interviewing leadership and speaking with assembly-line workers, prior to paint²¹. Frames of experience and knowledge by workers and leadership informed his work, however upon completion his work sparked a negative reaction. In *Mutual Admiration, Mutual Exploitation: Rivera, Ford and the Detroit Industry Murals* author Graham W.J. Beal expands on this fact:

“When the murals were opened to the public, on March 17, 1933, the people who saw them were stunned. Some were shocked. The Detroit Catholic Students Conference requested that “a committee be appointed by the Holy Name Society, the Knights of Columbus and the League of Catholic Women to investigate Rivera’s murals, and if evidence warrants to protest against their retention on the tax-paid walls of this institution.” The Detroit Daily News described the murals “as coarse in conception... foolishly vulgar... without meaning for the intelligent observer... a slander to Detroit working men...” and “un-American.”²²”

Bahamin Azadi of Frontline.org discusses social and political messaging with Assyrian muralist Hannibal Alkhas. Mr. Alkhas painted the *Death to America* mural depicting Lady Liberty with a

²¹Saronne Rubyan-Ling, “The Detroit Murals of Diego Rivera,” *History Today*; London, April 1996, 36, <http://search.proquest.com/docview/202811532/abstract/9564602FD8284B48PQ/1>.

²²Graham W.J. Beal, “ART: Mutual Admiration, Mutual Exploitation: Rivera, Ford and the Detroit Industry Murals,” Text, Center for Latin American Studies (CLAS), June 23, 2014, <https://clas.berkeley.edu/research/art-mutual-admiration-mutual-exploitation-rivera-ford-and-detroit-industry-murals>.

skull face on the wall of the American Embassy, post 1979 revolution. It has become one of the world's most iconic murals. Mr. Azadi recognizes the impetus for large public space paintings in that they were motivated to change public identity through political and social imagery. Mr. Azadi summarizes an interview that took place with Mr. Alkhas positing post revolution paintings were in line with Soviet realism and explored themes of radical issues in anti-imperialism²³.

According to Mannay, frame of reference, experience and knowledge play a pivotal role for how visual narrative is ingested and processed²⁴. Authors, Rubayan-Ling and Azadi reinforce this line of thinking with Rivera and Alkhas, in that, visual narrative depicted in Detroit and Tehran evoke social, political, cultural thought and response.

2.2.2 | Steam and Human Centered Design

Additional disciplines and movements incorporating elements of Arts-Informed Research are Science, Technology, Engineering, Arts and Mathematics (STEAM) and Human Centered Design (HCD).

Over the past decade, the pedagogical movement of STEM (Science, Technology, Engineering and Mathematics) to STEAM has garnered attention due to its interdisciplinary nature with the inclusion of art. STEAM Education Theory and Practice written by Myint explains STEAM to be the intersection of disciplines, which emphasize design, performing arts (technical communication) and creative planning.²⁵

²³Bahamin Azadi, "Art | Painted Politics: The Mural in Modern Iran," FRONTLINE - Tehran Bureau, June 2012, <http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/tehranbureau/2012/06/art-painted-politics-the-mural-in-modern-iran.html>.

²⁴Mannay, Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods.

²⁵MyintSweKhine, Steam Education: Theory and Practice (New York, NY: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2019).

Also, indirectly linked to Arts-Informed Research is HCD. Based in San Francisco, IDEO a non-profit, oriented in community driven solutions, published the Field Guide to Human-Centered Design. The publication describes their design philosophy: empathy, optimism, iteration, creative confidence, making, embracing ambiguity, and learning from failure²⁶.

Elements of HCD seem to adopt certain arts-informed research methods such as social emersion, iteration and desire to know, with the pedagogical movement of STEAM.

Authors Myint and IDEO suggest that disciplines such as STEAM and HCD show promise. And, an interdisciplinary approach is critical to addressing sectoral and cross-sectoral development challenges from a bottom up, integrated and interactive approach.

2.3 | CVE and Resilience Programming

In a post 9/11 world, a major driver to intervene in Pakistan was the War on Terror: a hotbed for militancy, recruitment and fundraising by Al-Qaida and Taliban²⁷. Azam and Javaid wrote in the Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan that militant organizations cause continuous disruption of Pakistani society, while simultaneously challenging the writ of the government²⁸. And, that weak institutions at the national, provincial and local level have enforced procedural delays, corrupt practices and politicization of institutions,²⁹ thereby compounding the issues.

²⁶"The Field Guide to Human-Centered Design. Pdf" (IDEO.org, 2015).

²⁷"Pakistan-U.S. Alliance Evolves Post-9/11," PBS News Hour, August 9, 2004, <https://www.pbs.org/newshour/show/pakistan-u-s-alliance-evolves-post-9-11>.

²⁸Maryam Azam and Umbreen Javaid, "The Sources of Militancy in Pakistan," Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan; Lahore 54, no. 2 (December 2017): 1, <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1994394640/abstract/D8AF9A2CBE4D4237PQ/1>.

²⁹Azam and Javaid, 190.

The genesis of terms such as Violent Extremism (VE), Countering Violent Extremism (CVE), Preventing Violent Extremism and Resilience programming can be attributed to a post 9/11 world. CVE and Resilience programming engages societies from a multitude of vectors. Over the years, national governments, multilateral institutions and international non-governmental organizations (INGO) have struggled with nomenclature. Below is a look at the variation in CVE/PVE/Resilience and VE definitions.

In, *Why countering extremism fails: Washington's top-down approach to prevention is flawed.* Author, Ms. Khan defines CVE as the "use of non-coercive means to dissuade individuals or groups from mobilizing towards violence and to mitigate recruitment, support, facilitation or engagement in ideologically motivated terrorism by non-state actors in furtherance of political objectives"³⁰.

The United Nations (UN) Preventing Violent Extremism (PVE) Plan for Action focuses on prevention through the following themes: conflict prevention, good governance, engaging communities, empowering youth, gender equality, education and strategic communications³¹.

And the U.K. Department for International Development (DFID) looks at resilience programming through "The ability of countries, communities and households to manage change by maintaining

³⁰Humera Khan, "Why Countering Extremism Fails: Washington's Top-down Approach to Prevention Is Flawed.," *Foreign Affairs*, February 2015.

³¹ "UNOCT: Developing National and Regional Action Plans to Prevent Violent Extremism" (United Nations Office of Counter Terrorism, n.d.)

or transforming living standards in the face of shocks or stresses without compromising their long-term prospects.³²”

And, finally, the Swedish International Cooperation Development Agency (SIDA) states that violent extremism is a diverse phenomenon, without clear definition and it is not exclusive to any region, nationality or system of belief³³.

2.3.1 | Strategic Communication Intervention Framework

Understanding historical, political, cultural and religious narrative is critical to designing response narratives in the attempt to address complex development issues. USAID’s Office of Transition Initiatives (OTI) CVE toolkit touches upon the strategic communications campaigns that dovetail activities.

“Good messaging campaign principles apply: When it comes to using the media for counter or alternative messaging campaigns, the lessons for countering extremist narratives are similar to the lessons for effective messaging campaigns more broadly:

- *Understand the media environment.*
- *Design the campaign with local partners.*
- *Manage content and respond to community feedback.*
- *Get technical assistance along the way.*
- *The way users view and share media is social: Who someone knows will determine which messages they receive, and from whom a message is received will influence how it is understood. It is impossible to separate the message from the social environment.*

³²Patricia Sturgess, “What Is Resilience?” (Evidence on Demand, May 11, 2015), https://doi.org/10.12774/eod_tg.may2016.sturgessandsparey.

³³“Preventing Violent Extremism (PVE) through Development” (Swedish International Cooperation Development Agency (SIDA), n.d.), www.sida.se.

- *Countering narratives is not just about media: Tangible activities can be just as effective, if not more effective, at changing individuals' ideas and beliefs as the consumption of a message via the media.*
- *Unifying a variety of activities under a common brand can amplify the effects of individual activities by enhancing visibility and providing a sense of belonging.³⁴*

Prior to a communication campaign a diagnosis of political, socio-economic and cultural drivers is performed. USAID recognizes that stabilization activities must be accompanied with sound communication strategies that are inclusive of all mediums and groups.

CVE and Resilience programming has evolved since 9/11. A look at the transition that has occurred over time indicates an evolution to USAID's approach. USAID's 2009 Development Assistance and Counter Extremism: Guide to Programming can be considered topical or top down, rather than an immersive bottom up approach:

“Understanding the Problem and Identity Key Drivers in 6 Steps:

- *Step One: Determine the overarching characteristics of the VE phenomenon in the specific setting being analyzed.*
- *Step Two: Assess whether the primary task is one of prevention or mitigation. Determine whether recruitment, community support, or an enabling environment is the most pressing concern.*
- *Step Three: Identify which populations, geographical areas, and/or institutions are particularly vulnerable and why.*
- *Step Four: Ascertain those social processes and group dynamics that are critical to facilitating, undermining or protecting against recruitment to and/or community support for VE.*

³⁴“USAID CVE Toolkit” (Office of Transition Initiatives, February 2018), 3.

- *Step Five: In reviewing the analysis in steps 1-4, determine the key political, socioeconomic and cultural drivers at work and assess their salience and how they interact.*
- *Step Six: Prioritize drivers and target locations; determine DA and strategic communications interventions.³⁵*

Nine years later, in 2018, OTI addresses political transition and stabilization efforts involving CVE assessments and interventions. The excerpt below is indicative of USAID’s institutional thinking:

“CVE programming requires analyzing local environments, triangulating information, questioning and testing assumptions, taking risks, being entrepreneurial and innovative, and adapting programming as learning evolves and the context changes. With these general principles in mind, the following highlights some overall lessons that may be more specific to CVE programming:

- *No Silver Bullets: The number one lesson USAID/OTI has learned about CVE programming is that there is no one answer to countering violent extremism.*
- *Clustering, Layering & Sequencing: Clustering, layering, and sequencing of interventions are important to achieving results in complex operating environments where drivers of extremism are often interrelated, overlapping, and unclear*
- *Sustained Engagement: Related to clustering, layering, and sequencing is the principle that sustained engagement is critical to seeing changes in perceptions, attitudes, behaviors, and social networks.*
- *Importance of Social Bonds: Finally, while drivers of extremism will always depend on the context and often are hyper-local (no silver*

³⁵Guilain Denoeux and Lynn Carter, “Development-Assistance-and-Counter-Extremism-A-Programming-Guide-2009” (United States Agency for International Development, February 2009), <http://www.dmeforpeace.org/peaceexchange/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/Development-Assistance-and-Counter-Extremism-A-Programming-Guide-2009.pdf>.

bullets!), the role of social bonds on the path to radicalization and deradicalization is universally recognized.

- *CVE is Resource Intensive: Focus on Manageable Interests - A CVE challenge for USAID/OTI is that addressing drivers requires sustained and focused resources, intensive management, and time to see a larger impact.*
- *Plan Early on for What Comes Next: It is important for programs to consider follow-on work (Mission programming, host government efforts, local partner efforts, etc.).³⁶*

Assessments and interventions have become increasingly local, granular, agile, adaptive and more inclusive of civil society organizations, while community-based initiatives are driven by small grant programming.

2.4 | Theoretical Framework & Theory of Change

ToC is widely used in the international development space to help design, monitor and evaluate development activities. Institutions such as the United States Institute of Peace (USIP), the United States Agency for International Development (USAID), the United Nations Development Program (UNDP), the World Bank and a host of other non-governmental organizations, private sector and faith-based organizations utilize the theory.

The Theory of Change (ToC) has multiple roots. The origins can be grounded in the writings of evaluation theorists and practitioners Huey Chen, Peter Rossi, Michael Quinn Patton, and Carol Weiss³⁷. Furthermore, the theory can be traced to “Kirkpatrick’s ‘Four Levels of Learning Evaluation Model’”. Further progress and evolution have included Daniel Stufflebeam’s CIPP

³⁶“Office of Transition Initiatives CVE Toolkit” (USAID, Office of Transition Initiatives, February 2018).

³⁷“Pakistan,” May 29, 2019, <https://www.usaid.gov/pakistan>.

(context, input, processes and products) and the widely used logical frameworks (logframes) or logical models which set out causal chains usually consisting of inputs, activities, outputs and outcomes coupled to long-term goals³⁸.”

ActKnowledge is a social enterprise that is based at the Graduate Center of the City University of New York (CUNY) and is part of the university’s Center for Human Environments. ActKnowledge describes ToC in the following manner: “Theory of Change is a rigorous yet participatory process whereby groups and stakeholders in a planning process articulate their long-term goals and identify the conditions they believe have to unfold for those goals to be met.³⁹” The theory requires for the practitioners to identify desired outcomes, causal frameworks, interventions, indicators, rationales and assumptions during the design phase of a program.

The VASL Artist Association (VASL) and the Indus Valley School of Arts and Architecture (IVSAA) implemented the Walls of Peace counter narrative communications campaign developed a ToC for the purpose of guiding their intervention:

“If hate graffiti and messages are removed from the walls of Karachi and replaced with positive messages THEN the narrative of an inclusive and tolerant Karachi will be strengthened BECAUSE presence of negative messages contributes to ongoing polarization within the city.⁴⁰”

³⁸“TOC Origins,” Theory of Change Community, accessed July 22, 2019, <https://www.theoryofchange.org/what-is-theory-of-change/toc-background/toc-origins/>.

³⁹Dana Taplin, Ph.D. H. and Heléne Clark, Ph.D., “Theory of Change: A Primer on Theory of Change” (ActKnowledge, Inc., March 2012).

⁴⁰“I Am Karachi: Walls for Peace Green Light Activity Grant Document” (Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture, August 2016).

The application of this theory will be further discussed in the theoretical framework sub-section of this literature review and findings section of this study.

2.5 | Everyday Peace Indicators

The Everyday Peace Indicator (EPI) is a non-for-profit organization focused on community driven bottom up approach to peace, reconciliation, governance and violent extremism⁴¹. Additionally, “the Everyday Peace Indicator research approach is driven by the premise that beneficiaries are best placed to determine the efficacy of the external interventions, policies, programs, and projects designed for them⁴².” EPI positions the community to produce indicators that identify local issues relating to conflict and peacebuilding. The emphasis is placed on local community interventions to assess and design interventions on behalf of themselves, instead of external actors.

EPI’s process is the following:

“Stage 1: Develop – Local partners conduct representative focus group discussions with community members to generate a long list of indicators that people are already using in their daily lives to measure their own peacefulness.

Stage 2: Verify - Participants follow a two-step verification process where they first refine the original lists by adding or subtracting indicators, then rank the indicators by voting. Additional community members help to identify the most representative indicators.

Stage 3: Analyze - Local partners and program managers apply the everyday indicators as a diagnostic tool to understand community priorities and design projects and programs in a grounding process to meet the needs of communities to foster greater ownership and sustainability.

⁴¹“Everyday Peace Indicators » About,” accessed August 23, 2019, <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/about/>.

⁴²Pamina Firchow, “Everyday Peace Indicators” (Everyday Peace Indicators, May 2016).

Stage 4: Survey - Local fieldworkers survey the community using mobile phone applications with the refined list of indicators. Surveys are repeated frequently to be able to track whether or not people's perceptions of peace and safety in their communities have changed.”

2.6 | Synthesis, Analysis & Gaps

The literature review spans two primary themes: AIRM, CVE and Resilience programming. In order to contextualize the complexity of Karachi primary themes contained sub themes, which was necessary to evaluate at the reality of intervention and the purpose of this research.

Knowles, Cole, Savin-Baden and ALI establish and reinforce that AIRM are multi-dimensional, qualitative in nature, rigorous, iterative, and analytic. Moreover, they employ the use of sight, smell, hearing, taste, touch, observation, interactive and critical dialogue to further inform their research.

ARM sub-themes included a brief examination the work of Mr. Rivera and Mr. Alkhas to demonstrate the power and impact of visual narrative. Additional sub-themes touched upon the interdisciplinary nature of STEAM and HCD in relation to arts-informed research method.

The second of the two primary themes examined CVE and Resilience programming. UN, SIDA, DFiD, and USAID literature defined foundational CVE/PVE/Resilience and VE definitions the role of militancy in Pakistan and the importance of counter narrative strategies. Sub-themes reflect the evolution of method and mitigation to complex CVE interventions. Additional sub-themes explored industry tools that are utilized in assessing an intervention such as theories of change and accompanying indicators.

An analysis of the literature suggests that ARM, CVE and Resilience programming are evolving in concept and practice. Topically the two primary themes seem worlds apart, yet they seem to reside in the nuances of the human condition. If the literature is of any indication, ARM, STEAM, HCD, CVE/Resilience, ToC and EPI have the collective ability to assess complex social environments and promote peacebuilding through a mutually respected interdisciplinary approach.

The literature is mostly void of examples of where the two approaches converge. The OTI CVE Toolkit does touch upon the diagnostic tools necessary to examine the social nuances in complex environments; however there is a scarcity in literature examining the formal linkages between ARM and CVE/Resilience programming.

2.7 | Conclusion

The literature review explores a potential connection between two semi-related thematic: ARM and CVE/Resilience programming. By exploring knowledge, practice and theory the literature demonstrates that qualified artist and development practitioner have overlap and common end goals. Artists employ a non-linear qualitative research method through a fundamental question of wanting to know, observation, examination, iteration, process and reflection. And, state actors are improving their design methods to agile development programming from the bottom up in hopes of mitigating ideological and structural issues. Exploring, co-creating and collaborating at the technical level may result in more meaningful development impacts.

CHAPTER THREE | METHODOLOGY

3.1 | Introduction

The methodological framework for this study consists of the following sections: research philosophy, research strategy, research method, data collection methods, and data analysis. Closing out this chapter will be ethical considerations and research limitations sections.

3.2 | Research Philosophy

The researcher grounds his research strategy in the following philosophies: Interpretivism epistemology and constructivist ontology. Steup defines epistemology “As the study of knowledge, epistemology is concerned with the following questions: What are the necessary and sufficient conditions of knowledge? What are its sources? What is its structure, and what are its limits?”⁴³ And Epstein, states that, “Social ontology is the study of the nature and properties of the social world. It is concerned with analyzing the various entities in the world that arise from social interaction.”⁴⁴

Considering the human, social and physical environments artist and development practitioner overlap interpretation is a necessary tool for how they observe and engage socially constructed environments. Mathison states that “Interpretivism is about contextualized meaning involving a belief that reality is socially constructed, filled with multiple meanings and interpretations, and

⁴³Matthias Steup, “Epistemology,” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, ed. Edward N. Zalta, Winter 2018 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2018), <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2018/entries/epistemology/>.

⁴⁴Brian Epstein, “Social Ontology,” in *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, ed. Edward N. Zalta, Summer 2018 (Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2018), <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2018/entries/social-ontology/>.

that emotions are involved.⁴⁵” Dovetailing Interpretivism is constructivism, which Coghlan and Brydon-Miller explain, “In the social science literature on constructivism that is most relevant to action research, this paradigm is defined as a view of human beings as actively constructing knowledge, in their own subjective and intersubjective realities and in contextually specific ways.⁴⁶”

The interpretative-constructivist foundation for this research study enables the researcher to gather field data by way of social interactions involving research participants and observation. This philosophical underpinning permits the researcher to investigate, interpret and process social and physical environments in order to gain additional knowledge relating to the phenomenon. The described philosophical base will lay the foundation for a qualitative approach.

3.3 | Research Approach: Qualitative

The qualitative approach was chosen over a quantitative approach in order to contextualize and acknowledge the complexity of the actors involved in the work that was being conducted. Most certainly, the program is quantifiable. In the first year, the Walls of Peace campaign painted over 2,500 8×10^{47} walls throughout Karachi city streets to counter visual hate narrative. However, given the scale of the project and multitude of actors involved that grounding in qualitative inquiry would be best suited to understanding the phenomenon. Denzin and Lincoln “offer an ‘initial, generic definition’:

⁴⁵“Interpretivism,” in Encyclopedia of Evaluation, by Sandra Mathison (2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States of America: Sage Publications, Inc., 2005), <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412950558.n289>.

⁴⁶“Constructivism,” in The SAGE Encyclopedia of Action Research, by David Coghlan and Mary Brydon-Miller (2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks, California 91320: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2014), <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446294406.n83>.

⁴⁷Adeela Suleman, Director, Fine Arts Department at Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture, interview by Researcher, Digital Recording, April 23, 2019.

Qualitative research is a situated activity that locates the observer in the world. It consists of a set of interpretive, material practices that make the world visible. These practices transform the world. They turn the world into a series of representations, including field notes, interviews, conversations, photographs, recordings, and memos to the self. At this level, qualitative research involves an interpretive, naturalistic approach to the world. This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them. (2005a, p. 3)⁴⁸

The qualitative approach was best positioned to gain insights and reflections to complex program design and narratives, e.g., the macro CVE/Resilience intervention, the ethnic, political and religious non-state actor hate narratives, the bottom up local Karachiites public space campaign, and most importantly for this study, the arts-informed research assessment component. Furthermore, a qualitative approach unpacked social, political, economic and cultural structures, similar or dissimilar beliefs systems, behaviors, visual threat narratives and the tactical application of a counter narrative peacebuilding communication campaign.

Interacting and comprehending such a complex environment meant for the researcher to be open minded, engaged, aware, silent and inquisitive. As the study will indicate the research was grounded in qualitative methods.

3.4 | Research Method

The researcher generally understood a phenomenon had taken place, in that; an artist collective was the vanguard of a CVE/Resilience program, but why and how? Ms. Jean J. Schensul posits that “Research methodology consists of the assumptions, postulates, rules, and methods—the

⁴⁸Uwe Flick, *Designing Qualitative Research* (1 Oliver’s Yard, 55 City Road, London England EC1Y 1SP United Kingdom: SAGE Publications, Ltd, 2007), <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849208826>.

blueprint or roadmap—that researchers employ to render their work open to analysis, critique, replication, repetition, and/or adaptation and to choose research methods.⁴⁹” There was little publicly available information as to why and how this program was initiated or designed.

For the purposes of this case study the researcher traveled to Karachi, on April 12, 2019 for approximately three weeks and immersed himself in a vibrant, yet chaotic city. Due to his prior vocation, and extended family members whom reside in Karachi, the researcher obtained access to participants in the USAID and Walls of Peace program value chain.

In this single case study, the researcher ascertained his data by conducting interviews, site visits, and examining existing project data. Additional information and data were ascertained by engaging development practitioners, project implementers, various artists’ collaborators, and academics.

3.5 | Interviews

10 participants volunteered their time for interviews. Interviews were structured and unstructured, formal and informal, and on the record and off the record. Furthermore, certain interviewees requested to remain anonymous within the construct of this study due to their positions in government, international donor agencies or have private sector affiliations. Interviews lasted anywhere from 30 minutes to over an hour and half. With prior agreement in signing an official consent form, certain interviewees agreed to an audio recording of their interview. Audio transcriptions were produced for interviewees whom had agreed to be recorded. Participants that

⁴⁹Jean J. Schensul, *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Methodology* (2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008), <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909>.

did not agree to the recordings were still required to sign the official consent form, however they did not check the permission to record box. In this case, the researcher took copious notes.

Questions were open ended with a semi-structured frame to guide not only the interviewee, but the researcher as well. The semi-structured model worked very well for the researcher because the researcher knew very little regarding the Walls of Peace campaign. The semi-structured format allowed for project roles, project synopsis, free flowing inquiries, deeper dive into the nuance, and re-looping of initial questions, in which the interviewee and the researcher could come to mutually understand.

3.6 | Observation

Researcher observations were facilitated by two drivers. The initial driver was to locate and view the murals and corresponding visual text that the artist collective had painted. To dovetail the first driver, the second driver was to locate visual narrative (graffiti) that had been weaponized by ethnic, political or religious parties.

The researcher went to approximately 8 locations in search of both, positive and negative visual narrative. The locations varied, from the outskirts of Layari, which is infamously known to be the most dangerous parts of Karachi to M.T. Khan Road to St. Joseph's Church and School complex. Other locations included Gulshan Road, Karachi's Cantt train terminal and the Press Club.

Additional observations entailed note taking and capturing images of the mural locations, physical environment, wall conditions, and from a distance crowd response or reaction.

3.7 | Data Collection Method

A multitude of materials were analyzed for this study. Official documents were either requested at the researchers request or voluntarily provided from actors in the program value chain.

USAID provided a Countering Violent Extremism factsheet and a Community Resilience Activity overview document that focused on civic engagement. The Office of Transition Initiatives (OTI) provided a detailed overview to their approach in CVE/Resilience assessment and lessons learned. Additional data was procured through off the record interviews.

The bulk of materials were provided by the VASL art collective who were responsible for implementing the first phase of the Walls of Peace program. VASL provided awardee final reports, pre-surveys, surveys, and post surveys. Also provided were staffing assignments, cost of materials, burn rate and pipeline budgets, research methodology reports, pre and post wall imagery, incident reports, awardee monthly reports, location maps, design proposals, meeting minutes, strategy documents, power point presentations, open call for artist solicitations, work plans and associated activity calendars.

The researcher additionally scanned online sources for articles, news stories, editorials, blogs, videos, images and opinion pieces to locate references to the Walls of Peace campaign. Additionally, he searched library databases for topics relating to violence in Karachi, Pakistan Government involvement to combat militancy, terrorism, and organized crime syndicates. Also scanned were Al-Qaida, Islamic State, recruitment and finance for their presence in Karachi. Regarding strategic communications, the researcher also researched topics relating to semiotics, graffiti, public space campaigns and art activism.

3.8 | Data Analysis

In order to answer the research question and to perform a thematic analysis the data was organized by source, relevance, level of importance, and content type. Theory of change needed to remain at the forefront of data analysis.

When mining data for themes and recurrent themes, the researcher scanned data relating to peacebuilding, ethnic, political and religious conflict, program design, arts-informed research, application of five senses, empathy, strategic communication and visual narrative, local empowerment and public space.

In analyzing the data, the researcher remained focused on the thematic above and therefore utilized the Everyday Peace Indicator (EPI) Category Codebook. First EPI's ethos states "EPI research approach is a cooperative, bottom-up endeavor. As a starting point, it believes that local communities are best placed to conduct research on their own communities – they understand the context best.⁵⁰" And, due to the formal and informal artist community playing a primary role in implementing an internationally funded CVE/PVE/Resilience program the EPI indicators were appropriate. The following indicators were applied to analyze data:

Cohesion & Interdependence: Indicators that stress relationships and community cohesion and dynamics between individuals and groups. For example: "People will help each other when they are in trouble rather than just stand by and watch" or "the village participates in activities with neighboring villages." (working together, responsive leaders, traditional rituals

⁵⁰"About," Everyday Peace Indicators, May 6, 2013, <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/about/>.

Infrastructure: Indicators dealing with infrastructure and development, such as roads, dams, electricity, Internet, etc. (electricity, access to water, development of roads, internet, access to information)⁵¹

Conflict resolution: Indications that community members see conflicts being resolved without violence in their communities. For example: “Having good relationships with your neighbors” or “Respect for each other in the household/community” “Dialogue in the community” or “Good relations with neighboring communities” (people approach chief to resolve conflicts, good communication with neighbors)

Security: Crime - Indicators concerned with issues of crime within the community. Examples: “Bad people/gangsters in the street” or “gang violence” or “drugs” or “petty crimes” or “increase in meth houses/shebeens (gunshots, robbery, drugs/prostitution, reporting of)⁵²

3.9 | Ethical Considerations

Ethical awareness is imperative when conducting a study. For the purposes of this study the researcher applied the four main areas of ethics contained in Bryman’s Social Research Methods 4th Edition, “usefully broken down by Diener and Crandall (1978) into four main areas: 1. whether there is harm to participants; 2. whether there is a lack of informed consent; 3. whether there is an invasion of privacy; 4. whether deception is involved.⁵³”

With regard to harming to participants, the researcher was aware of the sensitivity of the study being conducted. The political impetus behind the program involved senior government officials

⁵¹“Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016” (Everyday Peace Indicators, May 2016), <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/codebooks/>.

⁵²“Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016.”

⁵³Alan Bryman, Social Research Methods, 4th ed. (Oxford; New York: Oxford University Press, 2012), p.135.

and foreign policy agendas. Also, the activity itself required a physical intervention in which Pakistani participants and associations could be negatively impacted at a later time. Therefore, the researcher was ensured by participants that no harm would come by discussing project details.

Any form of discussion regarding the study, the researcher was very clear to communicate that the inquiry was part of an ongoing study. The researcher consistently held multiple copies of the consent form and presented the form for signature when it was appropriate. The consent form was comprehensive in describing the study and identified the researcher to the academic university. Due to the rigor of the study and the sensitive nature of the activity the researcher would engage in only informed consent.

When collecting data, participant privacy was at the forefront of this study. Up and down the program value chain the researcher's participant network relied on the assurances of privacy. The researcher communicated clearly that any information provided was in confidence and that it would not be shared without explicit permission. Furthermore, privacy meant that associated documents and audio recordings would be kept in a secure authorized location stipulated by George Mason University.

Deception to gain information is not only unethical, but dangerous. As the researcher noted earlier, the Walls of Peace activity could be viewed as sensitive, depending on the optic of inquiry. Through the research process, the researcher ensured that transparency, clarity and purpose of study were made clear to participant involvement.

The researcher applied the four main ethical areas necessary to conduct the study. And more importantly, the researcher communicated clearly to participants the purpose of the study, why

their informed consent was an absolute prerequisite to ensuring that the information shared would remain private, and that the purpose of the study was transparent, accurate and clear.

3.10 | Research Limitations

The researcher did encounter limitations when performing his study. Although not surprising, access to certain senior government officials was difficult to arrange. Perhaps, certain officials were quite busy or that the topic of CVE/Resilience programming was better examined by the activity, so not to be linked to any one individual.

An additional limitation encountered was with the inaccessibility to formal CVE/Resilience assessments, design documents and learning processes. Unfortunately, persuading state-actors to share formal documents was a non-starter due to needing a security clearance.

Limitations were expected and the lack of access to certain senior authority figures, in addition to, key CVE/Resilience practitioners did impact the study. Nevertheless, a thorough examination of the Walls of Peace activity enabled the researcher to uncover clues and work through these limitations.

3.11 | Conclusion

This chapter concludes the methodology section of this study. The researcher presented the philosophical foundation and the qualitative research approach. He also shared his methodology on interview process, observation, data collection and analysis process. Covered were also the ethical conduct and guidelines to perform a study. Lastly, the researcher shared limitations he encountered he encountered while conducting his case study. In the next chapter the researcher shares his findings.

CHAPTER FOUR | FINDINGS



Karachi Cantt Train Station Walls Painted by Haider Ali, drawn by Abdul Rahim, May 2016⁵⁴

⁵⁴"Our City & the State of Its Walls" (A VASL Publication for I AM KARACHI, 2016).

4.1 | Introduction

Chapter 4 presents findings from field research conducted in Karachi, Pakistan. The findings are within the context of a social phenomenon, which united a national government-international donor funded CVE and Resilience response with an artist collective's desire to alter Karachi's visual narrative.

For the purposes of reference, it is practical to reintroduce the research question:

Question: Within the context of a donor funded CVE/Resilience activity, what impact did an art-based intervention have on ethnic, political and religious tension throughout Karachi?

To further evaluate the case study, interviewees were asked the following questions pertaining to:

Security Drivers: What was the security situation in Karachi from 2011 to 2015, which may have prompted an intervention?

Weaponization of Visual Narrative: How did visual narrative (graffiti/wall chalking) fuel ethnic, political and religious divisions?

Research Methods: How does an artist interpret social, political and cultural phenomenon?

Intervention: How did the Walls of Peace activity counter the weaponization of visual narrative (graffiti/wall chalking)?

Public Response: What was indicative of the activity to determine the campaign's success or failure?

Notable Concerns: What issues were noted before, during and after the activity?

Evidence and data are presented in six thematic sections. Further, evidence and data were collected in the form of audio recordings, field notes, observations, project documents and on-line media sources. Evidence was curated for relevance and prioritized. To re-iterate from the methodology

section, the 10 interviews were structured and unstructured, formal and informal, on the record and off the record. Furthermore, certain interviewees wished to remain anonymous due to their affiliations with government, international donor agencies or private sector entities. Duration of interviews ranged from 30 minutes to over an hour and half.

The first section of Chapter 4 explores Karachi's security situation for linkages between city disposition and necessity for counter narrative, circa 2011 to 2015. Subsequently, the section also explores the frame of violent extremism within the context of tolerance, inclusivity and narrative. Sections two explore visual narrative effecting Karachi citizens via news articles and additional interviews. In section three, arts-informed research methods are discussed to contextualize their undocumented use in the overall campaign. Section four and five delve into project intervention and public response. The sections are aligned in a way that presents evidence in a chronological order from circa, 2011 to 2015.

4.2 | Insecurity Drivers



Top Image: Entrance of Jinnah Hospital container positioned to block truck bombs.⁵⁵
Lower Image: Container painted to temper fear amongst hospital employees and visitors.

Question: What was the security situation in Karachi from 2011 to 2015, which may have prompted an intervention?

Pertaining to the state of security, question one uncovered additional and equal threads of importance that linked insecurity and violence to Karachi's social, political, economic and ethnic grievances.

Seven respondents (who were Pakistani) out of the total ten interviewees, identified that there was a need for the national government to address Karachi's violence, weak institutional governance and systemic corruption. Respondents asserted that a vacuum created by structural issues, an

⁵⁵House Photographer VASL, "Image: Entrance Jinnah Hospital" (Walls for Peace, February 27, 2015).

absence of law and order, and systemic corruption encouraged an increase in militancy, political and religious extremism, suspicion and intolerance.

A July 25, 2015 article in Dawn, originally published by Agence France-Presse (AFP) touches upon on the level of lawlessness, violence and fear:

“Karachi, Pakistan’s economic capital and biggest metropolis, has been swamped in recent years by a wave of extortion, murder and kidnapping — for religious, criminal, ethnic and political reasons.”⁵⁶”

Respondent 1, identified as Ms. Adeela Suleman, Project Director for the Walls of Peace campaign further expands by describing the city chaos in the following excerpt:

Respondent 1, Walls of Peace Project Director:

“Karachi works on its own. So, it's a mad city with 25 million people living over here and most amounts of minorities are also over here. So, I think it has its madness.

Like it has the land mafia, the traffic mafia, the water mafia, right and, and we live with the violence which is inflicted upon you. And then there is city violence, which is in any city in the sense that it will happen in London, the city crimes that happen. Right. So when, but when both of them combined together, it gives it a little cocktail. It has always been a troubled city so there have been bouts of peace or bouts of violence, but then, then everything comes down and then everything starts again.

I think that gives you a glimpse of the reality, you're not living in a bubble. Your realities busted every second, every day. It's chaotic, it's mad, but you are working with the real people with real issues and real problems.

⁵⁶AFP, “Artists Reclaim Karachi Walls from Hate Graffiti,” DAWN.COM, July 25, 2015, <http://www.dawn.com/news/1196150>.

So, it's not like that you are living no, not creating a problem. The problem is there in front of you.⁵⁷”

Ms. Suleman explains the intersect between non-state actors and its citizens by connecting the city’s crime syndicates with everyday street crimes. Additionally, she refers to the absence of law and order signaling the considerable peaks and valleys that occur in Karachi. She goes on to state that living in isolation or to avoid the city’s raw nature is not an option due to the fact that its citizens are confronted by the harsh realities of daily life.

Respondent 1 also speaks to corruption and lack of governance in the following excerpt:

Adeela Suleman, Walls of Peace Project Director:
I would say you go to Punjab and if you go to Lahore the scene is different in the sense that the government is so active over there, it's corrupt, but corrupt while delivering. The Sindh government is so corrupt that it doesn't even deliver. Right. So, Karachi people solve their problems and I'm a complete Karachiites, right? So, we have been, since our childhood we have been taught that you have to solve your problem on your own. Whether it is electricity, water, security, food, job, survival. You have to do it on your own, right. Sindh the government is not going to provide you anything. Punjab is functional and that's the only province which is probably Pakistan. The rest, there is no writ of the state and the rest of the province, neither in Baluchistan and nor Sindh. Maybe KPK now since Imran Khan has been there for the last eight, nine years⁵⁸.

Ms. Suleman identifies a weak writ and insufficient assertion of control, authority, and influence by the national government to manage provincial level structural issues, lack of consistent security

⁵⁷Suleman, Walls for Peace.

⁵⁸Suleman.

and systemic corruption. This position is further supported by authors Azam and Javaid that weak institutions at the national, provincial and local level have enforced procedural delays, corrupt practices and politicization of institutions⁵⁹. She goes on further to compare provincial services as unequal and corrupt by comparing major cities, such as Lahore to Karachi. Furthermore, Ms. Suleman, points to the lack of basic utilities and services that contribute to city wide dysfunction and corruption, which highlights the structural issues Karachi faces. Lastly, she states that the Karachiites have no option but to be self-reliant. Corruption at the provincial level and unequal distribution of resources have led to gaps that non-state actors have exploited.

Systemic security failures and a weak provincial and city government have led to several interventions by national authorities to address the rise in militancy, political and religious extremism, gang activity, petty crime and the illegal distribution of narcotics. In the Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan, authors Azam and Javaid support this assertion by noting the continuous disruption of Pakistani society by militant organizations⁶⁰. Certain interventions were in the form CVE and Resilience activities.

National authorities with assistance from the international donor community did attempt to address the suspicion and intolerance, security dilemma, political and religious extremism. Respondent 4, who wish to remain anonymous, provided a violent extremism theory of change document pertaining to Karachi intervention. To be clear, the contents of this document did not originate from the Walls of Peace activity itself, but rather an umbrella program that was being instituted in Karachi.

⁵⁹Azam and Javaid, "The Sources of Militancy in Pakistan," 190.

⁶⁰Azam and Javaid, 1.



61

Translation: “Be with Caliphate” meaning help us to bring back Caliphate era. Additional interpretation: any Muslim Ruler of Baghdad until 1258 and of the Ottoman Empire from 1571-1924.

The contents of the document present themes of acceptance, collaboration, safe charity, safe heaven and subsequent objectives and theories of change:

Respondent 4, Document 1:
Violent Extremism | Theory of Change

“Acceptance

Objective: To increase acceptance of diverse backgrounds in targeted communities

Theory of Change: If individuals are exposed to people from diverse backgrounds, then the target geographies will be a less conducive environment to VE groups because inter-group grievances will be less effective tools for recruitment and support.

Collaboration

Objective: To increase positive collaboration between targeted CVE stakeholders

⁶¹House Photographer VASL, “Image: ISIS graffiti” (VASL, July 18, 2016).

Theory of Change: If CVE stakeholders have opportunities and resources to collaborate and coordinate, then they will be able to provide a more effective counterbalance to the influence of VE groups in Karachi.

Safe Charity

Objective: To increase knowledge on how targeted beneficiaries can adopt practices that reduce their financial support to VE groups

Theory of Change: If awareness on safe charity practices among targeted beneficiaries is increased, then we will have increased the probability that VE groups' financial support, and thus operational capacity, will be reduced.

Safe Haven

Objective: To reduce the opportunities of VE groups to find refuge in targeted communities

Theory of Change: If awareness on safe haven issues among targeted beneficiaries is increased, then we will have increased the probability that VE groups' ability to find refuge in Karachi will be reduced, because communities are generally unaware of how they indirectly support VE actors and groups and have an interest in discontinuing that support.⁶²

The four themes identify objectives; theories of change to planning their long-term goals in identify the conditions they believe have to unfold for those goals to be met.⁶³

The *acceptance* segment highlights the need for inclusivity and tolerance towards different ethnic groups that espouse grievances through violent means. *Collaboration* points towards the tactful application of resources to form a collective force in order to mitigate extremism. The *safe charity*

⁶²Karachi Youth Initiative, "Karachi - Violent Extremism: Theory of Change" (Karachi Youth Initiative Program, 2015).

⁶³Taplin, Ph.D. and Clark, Ph.D., "Theory of Change: A Primer on Theory of Change."

segment communicates that alternative sources of charity exist as valid and vetted options for the public contribution. And, *safe heaven* focuses on the awareness and resilience pertaining to external groups residing in susceptible communities.

Respondent 1 provides a compelling composite, in that Karachi experiences intermittent law and order, inadequate government services and systemic corruption. Moreover, the theory of change document suggests VE is present and could possibly be mitigated through community buy-in, tolerance and inclusivity, clear communication and counter narratives.

4.3 | Weaponization of Visual Narrative



Photo by Naila Mahmood, Karachi⁶⁴

Question: How did visual messaging (graffiti/wall-chalking) fuel ethnic, political and religious tensions?

⁶⁴"Our City & the State of Its Walls."

The visual narrative section examines *wall-chalking (graffiti)* and the weaponization of visual narrative by ethnic, religious and political groups. The author of this study researched on-line news publications and conducted interviews to ascertain the severity of the graffiti problem and the necessity of a counter visual campaign.

A July 25, 2015 article in Dawn, originally published by Agence France-Presse (AFP) notes the role graffiti plays in city-wide visual narrative.

“KARACHI: For years Karachi’s walls have been spattered with the bloodstains of murder victims and scrawled with graffiti touting everything from sectarian hatred to quack cures for erectile dysfunction⁶⁵.

The continuous barrage of negative messaging sets a repetitive tone throughout the city. Society interprets visual narrative based upon frames of experience and knowledge⁶⁶. An additional Dawn article quotes Veera Rustomji, a student of Indus Valley of School of Arts and Architecture:

“KARACHI: Half the city is drowning in garbage and the other half in religious, political, lewd and intolerant text that can be seen at every nook and corner. If you look around you will only see dirty walls full of opinionated content and slogans.⁶⁷”

In Pakistan, a common synonym for graffiti is wall-chalking. The researcher was unfamiliar with the term; however, an online publication MVSLIM helps in defining the term:

‘Wall chalking’, which refers to painting messages on walls, has long been a way to communicate in the public forum in South Asia. While this

⁶⁵AFP, “Artists Reclaim Karachi Walls from Hate Graffiti.”

⁶⁶Mannay, *Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods*, 64.

⁶⁷Hussain Ali | Momina Khan, “In Karachi: When Hate on the Wall Disappears,” DAWN.COM, May 25, 2015, <http://www.dawn.com/news/1184142>.

medium has traditionally been used to advertise the local hakeem or to promote election candidates, in the past decade 'wall chalking' messages have taken on a more sinister tone with sectarian, extremist and political groups using them to promote violent agendas⁶⁸.

Respondent 2 provides a glimpse into how wall-chalking has been weaponized and propagated by ethnic, political and religious groups.

Respondent 2, Walls of Peace Lead Painter:

"In 2011, Karachi politics was on a sectarian basis. MQM is a Muhajir or Urdu speaking vote. People's Party is a Sindhi vote. ANP is a Pukhtoon vote. PTI had little power. Nawaz Sharif is a Punjabi vote. The base of the community, for example, Urdu speaking community wall chalking was pro MKM and Altaf Hussain, and if you go to Layari, wall chalking was obviously Baloch and Sindhi vote bank. Layari a gang war or messaging was toward Pakistan Peoples Party (PPP). Communities that are mostly religious have chalking by political and religious parties.⁶⁹"

In reference to ethnic, political and religious parties; anonymity in wall-chalking message and group insecurity by labeling one-another other, an excerpt from respondent 1 interview further explanation:

Respondent 1, Walls of Peace Project Director:

Otherwise when they're writing hate messages, they don't write who has written the work. Right? So, the thing is that its right there, all the religious party will of course be against all the minorities and all the non-Muslim minorities in Pakistan. So, I think we are so insecure that we have to badge the other person in order to gain importance⁷⁰.

⁶⁸Zarina Khan, "Painting the Town Positive – Fighting Extremism with Inspirational Art," Mvslim, June 6, 2015, <https://mvslim.com/painting-the-town-positive-fighting-extremism-with-inspirational-art/>.

⁶⁹Munawar Ali Syed, Lead painter: Walls for Peace, interview by Author, Digital Recording, April 27, 2019.

⁷⁰Suleman, Walls for Peace.

The articles and interviews demonstrate how the visual medium can be weaponized to sow division amongst ethnic, religious and political groups. Depending on accrued cultural experience visuals can evoke memory, reflection and feelings⁷¹. Furthermore, it establishes the influence visual narrative can have on society through unchecked public space messaging.

4.4 | Research Methods



Data Collection & Surveys H. J. Rustomjee Bagh, Karachi

Question: How does an artist interpret social, political and cultural phenomenon?

The research methods section presents excerpts of one specific interview. Respondent three, Andrew Freiband is the director of the Artist Literacies Institute (ALI) based in Brooklyn, New York and a former arts professor at the Rhode Island School of Design (RISD). The researcher

⁷¹Mannay.

sought out Mr. Freiband to seek a discussion as to why and how arts-informed research methods, or as he calls them, artist literacies, are unique, and perhaps are equal to traditional science-based research methods. In June of 2019, the researcher interviewed Mr. Freiband in Brooklyn, NY via Skype.

The following excerpt from Mr. Freiband interview discusses learning methods artist employ to develop knowledge, from the world around them.

Respondent 3: *Andrew Freiband, ALI*

“Artist literacy is a way of knowing, we see, we hear, we touch, we smell, we sense. [...], so, artists tend to come to their discipline through a fairly intuitive and organic process. Because what art making is, is learning. Do you learn by listening? Do you learn in terms of real classic pedagogical questions, you know, what kind of learner are you?

These are fundamental ways of knowing, and science as it's been practiced in the West has codified a certain set of those ways of knowing, the empirical method is created, quote unquote rigorous means of knowing about the world around us. Any artists can reproduce their results. They can reproduce emotional effects in their audiences. They can reproduce experiments that test us and stretch us and expands us as humans.

What artists literacies is, is really meant to do is to provide a structure, so that highly variable artist's methodologies can all be brought back to recognizable evidence gathering framework. So, whether you're a painter, photographer, whatever it is, they know how to draw the evidence out of their practice and then provide that evidence to their partners in research.⁷²”

⁷²Andrew Freiband, Artist Literacies Institute, interview by Author, Digital Recording, June 21, 2019.

Mr. Freiband focuses on artists' intuitive learning process and method of applying the five senses to gain knowledge from their environment. His argument suggests that artist's methods of inquiry and process are equal to science-based methods because they are rooted in knowledge, rigor, iteration, and can be replicated to inform their practice. This process is further supported by a qualitative reflexive process that incorporates data from diary notes, creative expression, artifacts, narratives revealed by way of inquiry⁷³ Furthermore, Mr. Freiband notes that through an artists' practice, a formal evidence framework is produced, in which results could be shared.

In the next excerpt, Mr. Freiband and I discussed the practical application of these methods in a field setting of a development program.



Photo by Naila Mahmood, Karachi

“If they [development practitioners] have an artist present, it provides a kind of access that the development agency doesn't otherwise have. Artists are social and it's a social process. Whether they're painting, taking photographs, drawing, writing, making music they're going to do a couple of things. One is they're going to do it communally. Like artists will go to a place and seek out other artists, seek out other people like them. So, it

⁷³Savin-Baden, *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research*.

immediately starts building connections, networks and communities that development agencies don't potentially have. The value of those networks is that the artists in any community are the most socially and politically fluid faction of that society.

When they're actually making their work, learning about the system that they're a part of and learning about the context that they're situated in, the artists' creative practice opens up that kind of dialogue and discourse. [...] the evidence now is coming directly from the community, from the constituents that are going to be affected by that way to help the program.

My argument would be that all of those things also exist when artists produce knowledge first and objects second. They navigate between class, race, gender in ways that no nobody else can.⁷⁴

According to respondent 3, there is a significant value that an artist presence provides to development programs. The interaction between art and social science further advances the knowledge and response of human action and experience⁷⁵. Mr. Freiband posits that an artist natural political and cultural orientation result in intimate community level discourse that otherwise development practitioners would miss. Further, he states that because artists are social and communal by practice they have access to a wide range of connections and networks.

The next section, Intervention, builds on the themes of security, visual narrative and research method.

4.5 | Intervention

⁷⁴Freiband, Artist Literacies Institute.

⁷⁵"Savin-Baden - 2014 - A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research. Pdf," n.d. Introduction p. 1



M.T. Khan Road, Before and After, Karachi

Question: How did the Walls of Peace activity respond to the weaponization of visual messaging (graffiti/wall chalking)?

Section 4.5 presents findings from direct field observation, documents, interviews and field notes.

Respondent four furnished multiple documents for review of activity. The Walls of Peace Grant overview statement presents the issue, program objective, activity mechanism and response framework.

Walls of Peace Grant Activity Document

“Karachi’s walls are covered in hate graffiti against ethnic groups as well as political parties. Thousands view these walls each day, potentially making viewers internalize the messages of hate to which they are constantly exposed. Under the program-level objective of supporting and strengthening the efforts of local networks engaged in CVE activities, this grant will be a continuation of the same previously initiated by I AM KARACHI, to eradicate adverse and negative wall chalking from select

high-traffic areas around the city and replace them with images promoting positivity, pride, and peace.⁷⁶

The document clearly indicates that Karachi walls are used as a medium to propagate messages of fear, division and hatred by a multitude of political and ethnic groups. Additionally, the document raises concerns of message consumption, public internalization, influence and psychological impact on everyday citizens.

The activity document also comprised of the Walls of Peace theory of change statement:

Walls of Peace Grant Activity Document - ToC statement

“If hate graffiti and messages are removed from the walls of Karachi and replaced with positive messages THEN the narrative of an inclusive and tolerant Karachi will be strengthened BECAUSE presence of negative messages contributes to ongoing polarization within the city.⁷⁷

The statement outlines the long-term programmatic goal of hate message removal. It posits that visual transformation of the city could lead to inclusivity and tolerance. Visual transformation could further promote conflict resolution and peacebuilding by stimulating dialogue amongst ethnic, religious and political groups⁷⁸.

The problem statement and theory of change set the stage for the Walls of Peace visual strategy. The strategy was based on four key words: *pride, ownership, hope and diversity*. Each theme was visually interpreted and depicted on walls throughout Karachi. The visual intervention representing each theme is described below:

⁷⁶“I Am Karachi: Walls for Peace Green Light Activity Grant Document.”

⁷⁷“I Am Karachi: Walls for Peace Green Light Activity Grant Document.”

⁷⁸“Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016.”

Visual Strategy:

Pride

For the citizens of Karachi, pride comes in various forms; their history, the iconic areas of the city, their literature and food. Heroes in the forms of athletes, literary figures, artists, unsung philanthropists and under recognized craftsmen are also the backbone for our city which were used as a source of inspiration for the visuals.



Ownership

Taking ownership of one's city comprises of civic responsibility and a commitment to improving the environment and preserving our heritage. To emphasize upon owning our city, slogans and images were composed to pay tribute to our native trees, encouraging awareness of our endangered species.

Hope

Karachi as a city has a turbulent history of unrest but has shown an unending resilience and a spirit of hope. Reframing this with powerful

messages of peace, empowerment, human rights, economic welfare, and recognition of citizens from all walks of life were echoed in our designs.

Diversity

Karachi is home to multiple ethnicities and religious sects. It is also home to a diverse range of communities, cultures, languages, arts and crafts. Acceptance and celebration of this diversity promotes tolerance, co-existence and unity. By visualizing symbols and iconic images that unite us all, diversity is celebrated⁷⁹.

The use of visual imagery to promote social realignment and behavioral change is a powerful communication tactic. It is even more powerful when enacted at grassroots level by local actors, civil society organizations and community members⁸⁰. *Pride* showcases the achievement of prominent individuals in order to educate and inspire local citizens. Images depicting *Ownership* encourage political, social and cultural engagement, self-accountability and awareness of one's surroundings. Images of *Hope* illustrate the power of resilience for a citizenry that lacks services, rights, and fluctuations in economic stability. And, images of *Diversity* pay tribute to inclusivity and tolerance toward the multicultural multilingual fabric of Karachi.

According to Ms. Suleman, staff security was the number one priority; therefore locations synonymous to VE activity were not specifically targeted in order to minimize security incidences and political fallout. Therefore, a decision was made early in the process to be inclusive of the entire city.

⁷⁹"Our City & the State of Its Walls."

⁸⁰"Everyday Peace Indicators » About."

Surveys were conducted to gauge public opinion, pedestrian frequency, visibility and automobile traffic. Additionally, a component of the research process examined infrastructure in order to identify walls that were suitable for paint or needed refurbishment. If walls needed repair the activity would fund the restoration process⁸¹. As noted earlier, Phase 1 comprised of painting 2,500 walls⁸².

Demographic research did lend to message tone and image selection, said Respondent 1⁸³. A survey document provided by Respondent 4, illustrates the type of information gathered for St. Josephs School and St. Patrick's Cathedral.

St Joseph's/ St. Patrick's Cathedral (till Islamia College)

1. Location with different schools present here
2. Residing members from different communities: Bohris, Parsis, Christians and Hindus. (extreme diversity)
3. Ethnic groups in Saddar include: Muhajirs, Sindhis, Punjabis, Kashmiris, Seraikis, Pakhtuns, Balochis, Brahuis, Memons, Bohras, Ismailis, etc. There are also Christian, Hindu, Parsis, Ahmadis, and other religious communities in Saddar. The population of Saddar Town is estimated to be nearly one million
4. St. Patrick's is a Roman Catholic school; second school to be built in the city and has produced well known leaders and personalities including 2 presidents and 2 prime ministers of Pakistan
5. St. Joseph's is a catholic high school for girls; founded in 1862 by the planning of Monsignor Steins, Vicar Apostolic of Bombay of that time and five Sisters of the Cross.
6. Islamia College is located nearby on MA Jinnah Road

⁸¹"Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016."

⁸²Suleman, Walls for Peace.

⁸³Suleman.

7. Schools adjacent: St Patrick's girls' and boys' school, Montessori in the same compound as the church, St Joseph's school and college, St Paul's,
8. Other nearby places include: Shiv Swaminarayan Mandir, Karachi Parsi Institute⁸⁴.

Furthermore, when researching geographic locations, Respondent 1 provided strategic insight in determining where to position counter narratives. The excerpt references Layari town, which is known for its crime syndicates, gang activity, targeted killings and overall extremism.

Respondent 1, Walls of Peace Project Director:

“So if you look at the city, the north side is poor and the south side is rich, this area of south is right next to the port and Layari, yeah; the main economic hub of Karachi, I think that was, uh, that was a security strategy because we thought that if you are just going to the move, the political gravity we might get in trouble or be, might get attacked by political parties. Right. And we just thought that let's remove everything because then there was like, okay, fine.”⁸⁵”

Observational notes taken by the researcher describe location aesthetics, image reactions, density of traffic, and general environment.

On day two of his visit to Karachi the researcher traveled by rickshaw to St. Josephs School and St. Patrick's Cathedral; his first site visit.

Field notes: Sarosh Hussain:

The murals painted are larger than life. Bright, colorful, vibrant and scale is 8 x 10. You can't miss them. Area is well kept with visible street sweepers present. Perhaps the proximity to Karachi Intelligence Crime Unit may

⁸⁴“Walls for Peace: Survey Notes” (Walls for Peace, December 2015).

⁸⁵Suleman, Walls for Peace.

*ensure cleanliness. People are generally happy walking past with intermittent glances. Pedestrian foot traffic is high.*⁸⁶

The researcher also noted the following observations when visiting Cantt Station, Karachi's main train hub:

Field notes: Sarosh Hussain:

*Train station is a busy commercial area. Automobile traffic and pedestrian traffic is very dense. Significant diesel exhaust and high decibel level. The city is alive. Mural of train and station is long and vibrant mixing color with black and white*⁸⁷.



Cantt Station Walls Painted by Haider Ali Drawn by Abdul Rahim May 2016

4.6 | Public Response

Question: How did the public respond, react or comment to the transformation taking place on streets of Karachi?

⁸⁶"Field Notes" (Author, May 2019).

⁸⁷"Field Notes."

The public response section focuses on post surveys responses contained in the final report. The section presents comments and thoughts by the artist themselves pertaining to social uptake and visual impact. Responses lend to a spark of social cohesion and inter-dependence amongst the public⁸⁸.

“Female student, St. Patrick School, age 10 -18

“I feel awful when there is negative imagery on the wall and tourists judge us and our country. “Before school started in August, these walls were so dirty and now we were all so surprised to see them clean and colored.”

Male, works in transport services, age bracket 45+

“These walls were useless before but now it has a meaning, it teaches us something. If you see Cantt bridge it’s full of advertisements for aalims and Nelson has painted them again giving more way to adverts. These walls have knowledge to them and scenery.”

Male, rickshaw driver, 45-60

Q: Does art combat violence and is it a peaceful way to communicate one's idea? Please explain.

A: Yes, it helps in clearing the minds of children and gives them an education of their city.

Q: How do you think the negative imagery on the wall’s effects children?

A It has a bad effect, but if they see beautiful walls such as these at H J Rustomjee Bagh, it calms them and gives them a new perspective. Especially the text that goes along with the images, it is like a school education on the walls.

Male, retired marine engineer, resident of H.J. Rustomjee Bagh, 45+

⁸⁸“Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016.”

Q: How do you think negative imagery on the walls affects children?

A: Negative imagery creates imbalanced minds in children. Since they do not see or hear any good things around them, they tend to take bad things as good or normal. Taking ideas of crimes and murder, rape, drinking liquor and gambling and etc. as a normal form of life”

Q: Do you think walls can be used as an effective way to communicate one’s idea? Please explain

A: Male, Railway Servant, 45 years old

“Yes, these can be used for communication”

A: Male, Driver, 22 years old

“Yes, as my own child wanted to touch the wall the first time he saw the painting”

A: Male, works at the guava juice shop, 34 years old

“Yes, it will be beautiful and clean – as it is in foreign countries.”

A: Male, Barber, 40 years old

“Yes, it would help a lot. The conditions of the area (Cantt) are a lot better now. It’s an act that would benefit the population.”

A) Railway Servant, 54 years old.

“Yes, it’s a good idea. It spreads awareness and the message of keeping the city clean.”⁸⁹

Artist testimonials:

Respondent 1:

I tell you, people were praising, clapping, giving us water, leaving caps for us. Like it was incredible. And people who were not artist, they approached us on the road with their designs and they said, can we, can we paint with you and, can we learn like a lot of artisan stopped.

Respondent 2:

⁸⁹“Awardee Final Report” (Walls for Peace, December 2016).

And at one point they are passing by a street. And, they witness a before and after process. And they realize ok wow, this is a painting. I have now seen a painting. This is also be a great contribution. There was visual impact, there were colors. The day before there was something else written. Now it's different. Now people are talking about the work and it will be publicly archived. Now you have left memories that have left an impact in someone's mind. And now you have contributed very, very brilliantly to the neighborhood social responsibility policy⁹⁰.

Respondent 1:

So, the economic benefit was that they were getting artists fee and we were taking care of all the material so, that was one economic benefit. That was one thing. The other thing was that the artists got a lot of commissions after these walls because people now knew that they can hire them and get things done⁹¹.

Responses to survey questions by everyday Karachiites and subsequent artist testimonials indicate social cohesion and interdependence amongst community members expressing pride and feeling motivated to maintain the newly painted walls⁹².

4.7 | Notable Concerns

Question: What issues were noted before, during and after the activity?

With any activity, not everything goes according to plan. The following excerpts reflect thoughts, concerns and challenges that arose during the planning and implementation phase.

Respondent 5 reflects on the challenges of implementing a hearts and minds communication campaign throughout Karachi.

⁹⁰Syed, Lead painter: Walls for Peace.

⁹¹Suleman, Walls for Peace.

⁹²"Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016."

Respondent 5:

“There is a catastrophic lack of enterprise and creativity. That since Pakistan has been, in void of arts and culture and creativity for a generation people overall ability to be innovative and creative, enterprising is almost zero.”⁹³”

Respondent 8 alludes to the lack of long-term interactivity between the murals and the public. Her comments reflect almost a one-dimensional aspect, post activity.

Respondent 8:

“Sort of teaching anything and everything is all about hands on learning experience. It has to be that you have to have all your senses involved in learning. So, you have to learn from real life and from things that are new. So, I feel that it is about the practical use and as you are sort of using it, it sort of is becoming part of your system. So, it just cannot be conceptual it cannot be big concepts and ideas of that are just sort of uh, abstract, they have to be practical, doing some-thing for the spaces, they are in thought provoking things are fine are, but you need, they need to be touchable.”⁹⁴”

Respondent 1 reflects on terminology, specifically the term “reclaim” and how its use in official narrative.

Respondent 1:

“So, I had terminology issue with I Am Karachi in terms of that they said that they want to reclaim the walls and I used to contest that. So, I feel I bring this up and will tell you that I used to say that the reclaiming is really bad word. I used to tell them because reclaiming from whom, they are as much was for any JamaatiIslami or any political party, so they were never our walls, they were everyone's walls. So, we can't reclaim them. And that

⁹³Mashoud Rizvi, Former Deputy Chief of Party, DAI, Digital Recording, May 2019.

⁹⁴Anonymous, Painter, interview by Author, Digital Recording, May 2019.

was my biggest struggle in terms of like changing the terminology because it's the mindset. And that was something that I was contesting that we had a symposium on this where everybody was discussing the project and Mashoud actually introduce me by saying that Adeela has huge issues in terms of the word reclaiming tasked to this campaign. And I used to say we can we recreate, we can redesign, we can redo, but we cannot reclaim them because they are not ours. You don't reclaim things which are not yours.⁹⁵”

Respondent 1 shared an additional thought regarding allocation of funds for a visual narrative campaign when significant salient issues are facing the city:

Respondent 1:

“The one challenge that I've always faced with myself was that our city, which has so many real problems like health, that we are investing so much on these walls, which will not be taken care of and after two or three years will be gone. Is that right? Is it worth spending so much amount of money on these walls? And I now think that it was worth it because when I see the walls now, they are clean.⁹⁶”

In the same vain, Respondent 8 notes that the visual narrative is ephemeral:

Respondent 8:

“Selecting the visual is one thing, but the lasting effect was something that I was looking at because the vision or whatever is going to be washed away soon enough.”

Respondent 3 shares additional thoughts regarding the arts and science:

Respondent 3:

⁹⁵Suleman, Walls for Peace.

⁹⁶Suleman.

“They've just done a better job of demonstrating rigor. They've done a better job of creating a vocabulary for it. Art works. However, science has been building their discipline on its own for a few hundred years and we're in a pretty bad place I think because of it. It's an imbalance because we're letting it work out of balance with our other ways of knowing. Design has been a bit of a corrective to that and I think that that's a big clue to what would happen if artists and designers, were allowed to demonstrate that their process works.”⁹⁷”

4.8 | Summary of Findings

A synopsis of the findings suggests that a combination of political, institutional and physical instability provided a gap for the weaponization of visual narrative, which further aggravated ethnic, political and religious division. This ultimately resulted in a fearful and disconnected public.

One of the major themes to emerge from the *security* question was that a culmination of factors contributed to the overall insecurity of the city. This finding suggests that weak institutional capacity led to the erosion of authority and rule of law. Additionally, lack of public services, scarce central resources and systemic corruption provided exploitable inlets for non-state actors, political parties, ethnic groups and religious parties to exploit grievances.

The major finding for the *visual narrative* section suggests that the unregulated and mostly anonymous medium of wall-chalking provided a platform for non-state actors, political, ethnic and religious groups to communicate messages of hate and division to the public. According to

⁹⁷Freiband, Artist Literacies Institute.

interviewees and news publications weaponization of visual narrative planted the seeds of division and negatively impacted society.

Findings from the *research methods* section suggest that knowledge, rigor, iteration was a default setting for the Walls of Peace artist collective. This process is further supported by a qualitative reflexive process that incorporates data from diary notes, creative expression, artifacts, and narratives revealed by way of inquiry⁹⁸. In relation to the Walls of Peace art collective the evidence suggests that the research conducted prior to paint was well thought out. Moreover, their social and political networks, communal sensibilities, and immersive approach positioned them in a unique space to succeed.

Findings from the *intervention* section indicate that the Walls of Peace activity had little input or involvement at the meta-level CVE/Resilience design phase. The activity mechanism was a grant and the Walls of Peace campaign executed their activity within the confines of a predetermined CVE assessment that had been conducted by the national government and donor agency. Having that said, artist had a clear theory of change to ground their activity. The Walls of Peace artist conducted location scouts, pre-surveys, and implemented a visual strategy, which drew on the emotional conscious of Karachiites. Additionally, the findings advance that the artist collective were well organized, methodical with their counter narrative strategy and grasped the scale of the task at hand. The murals spurred inquiry, thought and projected positive elements of the city.

Two major themes emerged from the *public response* section. The first finding indicated that messages of hate were talking a toll on the citizens of Karachi. Respondents to surveys repeatedly

⁹⁸Savin-Baden, *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research*.

stated that their children were negatively affected by hate messaging and that the constant barrage of unregulated advertising was out of control. Moreover, certain respondents indicated that they were embarrassed when foreigners viewed the walls; indicating perceptions mattered.

The second finding demonstrates an ecstatic response from the public. Elated locals would provide water and food to wall refurbishers and painters. Interviewees stated that locals would bring forth their own sketches and designs in order to share and be recognized. The activity became inclusive and the public were welcomed to join the artist as the murals were painted. Media reports and post-surveys suggest that a major change in public perception was due watching the physical effort put forth by the artist collective. I found the public to be supportive and involved as the aesthetic shift in visual narrative occurred.

The findings from the *notable concerns* section indicate a generational deficit in culture and arts throughout Karachi. An interviewee suggests that this is due to a lack of exposure to the arts, physical insecurity and scarce city resources. An additional outcome of the research suggests that the murals are one dimensional and not interactive, thereby limiting the effect of change. Lastly, a finding pertaining to terminology ensued. A debate involving the term “reclaim” was at the forefront during the design phase of the activity. An interviewee suggested that the walls cannot be reclaimed because the walls belong to everyone.

CHAPTER FIVE | DISCUSSION & CONCLUSION

5.1 | Introduction

The primary aim of this qualitative study was to assess if artist research methods within the context of a CVE/Resilience program were unique to CVE/Resilience political stabilization activities. Could the rigorous, iterative, immersive, network and communal research methods that artists employ be a value add to the meta-level design and assessment phase of a CVE/Resilience campaign or traditional programming?

Chapter Five includes an interpretation of *findings* that may help identify data correlations and patterns. Also included in this discussion are *implications* of findings in accordance with the theoretical framework and literary themes discussed in chapter two: arts-informed research, weaponization of visual narrative, CVE/Resilience frameworks, and strategic communications strategies. Rounding out this study are *limitations* the researcher encountered, *recommendations* for additional research and a brief *conclusion*.

Chapter five requires that the research question be posed again to correlate findings from chapter four with future research possibilities:

Question: *Within the context of a donor funded CVE/Resilience activity, what impact did an art-based intervention have on ethnic, political and religious tension throughout Karachi?*

To unpack this primary question the researcher put forth additional supporting questions:

Security Drivers: *What was the security situation in Karachi from 2011 to 2015, which may have prompted an intervention?*

Weaponization of Visual Narrative: *How did visual narrative (graffiti/wall chalking) fuel ethnic, political and religious divisions?*

Research Methods: *How does an artist interpret social, political and cultural phenomenon?*

Intervention: *How did the Walls of Peace activity counter the weaponization of visual narrative (graffiti/wall chalking)?*

Public Response: *What was indicative of the activity to determine the campaign's success or failure?*

Notable Concerns: *What issues were noted before, during and after the activity?*

This thesis had the aim of exploring five themes that contextualize the research question by understanding Karachi's complex environment: drivers of insecurity pertaining to political parties, ethnic groups and non-state actors; weaponization of visual narrative; arts-informed research methods; arts-based intervention and social discourse; and notable concerns, which prompted participants to discuss faults in programming, culture and methodology.

Findings from this study indicate that the Walls of Peace intervention transformed dilapidated public space to aesthetically pleasing clean environments. The data suggests that Karachi psychological and physical insecurity slightly shifted for the better by depicting visuals of pride, hope, and empowerment, public engagement, and the communal and inclusive nature of artists. The study also demonstrates a correlation between the use of visual hate messaging (wall-chalking) to further inflame ethnic, political and religious divisions by non-state actors. The analysis also confirms that positive visual narrative promotes social cohesion, security, ownership, empowerment and accountability.

5.2 | Interpretation of Findings

What I found was that the five themes provided a multidimensional and dynamic way to investigate a complex environment. These findings are broadly in line with two overlapping

agendas that brought together professional artists and civil society organizations with national authorities and international donor agency: a) institute a arts-based public space intervention to beautify and unify the citizens of Karachi, thereby instilling pride, hope, diversity and ownership⁹⁹; and b) reverse Karachi's slide of becoming a sanctuary city for militancy, violent extremism and crime syndicates by addressing the ethnic, political and religious division exploited by domestic political parties, and internal and external non-state actors¹⁰⁰.

5.2.1 | Security Drivers

The theme of Karachi *security*, circa 2011-2015; insecurity prevails with an absence of rule of law. It seems a direct correlation exists between insecurity and the emergence of non-state actors such as the ISIS, Al-Qaeda, Taliban or militant wings of political parties. The findings also suggests that a lack of city services, weak political institutions, finite resources and systemic corruption lead to intractable grievances, susceptible populations, which reinforce ethno-political divisions that pose harm to fellow citizens.

5.2.2 | Visual Narrative

The *visual narrative* section suggests that the most archaic ways of communicating a message can be extremely powerful, dangerous and manipulative regardless if the message is ephemeral or long term. In the case of Karachi, wall-chalking is as mighty as the sword. Frames of reference are based on experience and knowledge as Mannay states in Chapter 2. A constant barrage of visual advertising, voodoo medicine and witch doctor remedies¹⁰¹ can be harmful to the psychology of a human. Even more devastating to a society is when messages of division, hate and intolerance are

⁹⁹"Our City & the State of Its Walls."

¹⁰⁰"I Am Karachi: Walls for Peace Green Light Activity Grant Document."

¹⁰¹Syed, Lead painter: Walls for Peace.

propagated by majority ethnic groups upon minority ethnic groups. The findings suggest Imagery and narrative can cause long-term harm¹⁰² and potentially produce irrational behavior. A response pattern that emerged from participants and respondents was that wall-chalking had become weaponization and was causing harm to the citizens of Karachi.

5.2.3 | Research Methods

Within the *research methods* section, Mr. Freiband puts forth a compelling argument for why arts-informed research methods are a value add to development practitioners or to CVE/Resilience program designers. Anecdotal evidence from multiple case study participant convey that there was a reflexive process applied during the research process that incorporated data from field diary notes, observations, artifacts, and personal narratives by way of inquiry¹⁰³. The fact that artists are trained to be immersive, communal, and social; this taps them into politics, culture, counter-culture, pop-culture, conflict, race, class, gender, traditions and norms positions them to be positioned uniquely during the assessment phase of a program design.

5.2.4 | Intervention

Findings from the *intervention* section indicate that the Walls of Peace activity had little input or involvement at the meta-level CVE/Resilience design phase. The activity mechanism was a grant and the Walls of Peace campaign executed their activity within the confines of a predetermined CVE assessment that had been conducted by the national government and donor agency.

The city wide scope, project timeline and broad media exposure did assist in the mitigation of ethnic, political and religious conflict. The artist had a clear theory of change to ground their work.

¹⁰²Mannay, *Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods*, 64.

¹⁰³Savin-Baden, *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research*.

Phase 1 of the Walls of Peace intervention¹⁰⁴ activity took approximately two years to complete. The timeline of implementation consisted of pre-production (pre-surveys, design evaluations, visual design communication strategies, artist open calls, location assessment and mapping, security evaluations), production (wall refurbishment – cementing and plastering; mural painting) and post-production (post-surveys). Because the activity was executed at such a large scale and involved considerable labor, organizational thinking evolved due a substantially larger labor force. Furthermore, networks were formed amongst fellow artists, academic institutions, civil society organizations and city officials (government and law enforcement) indicating collaboration and communication.

The timeline permitted artists to imbed themselves in each community that was identified for change. Also, due to direct exchanges between artists and local residents, artists were immediately in tune with local political, economic, ethnic and religious issues¹⁰⁵. Residents also shared their joy, at the fact, that someone was taking the time to beautify their neighborhood. As the project gained momentum the press reports multiplied highlighting the ubiquitous indiscriminate narrative targeting rival political parties, ethnic groups, and religious minorities. Also, due to the upsurge in media reports, city officials were exposed for their insufficient and inadequate services for the citizens of Karachi.

What can be drawn from these findings are that artist have a unique set of skills that can assess, execute and evaluate complex environments by way of inquiry, access and immersion. An interpretation of one finding suggests that public space counter narrative campaigns such as the

¹⁰⁴Suleman, Walls for Peace.

¹⁰⁵Freiband, Artist Literacies Institute.

Walls of Peace need time to mature in order to offset formidable well established and well-funded narratives of division.

5.2.5 | Public Response

According to participants the *public response* was overwhelmingly supportive. Citizens were elated that positive messages were replacing hate messaging. Participants repeatedly stated the Walls of Peace campaign provided the people of Karachi with an activity to rally around. Pre-surveys indicated that messages of hate were taking a toll on the citizens of Karachi. An unexpected finding was that not very many people complained about the mural paintings. This was surprising to the researcher considering the lack of basic services such as clean drinking water, intermittent electricity, garbage collection, or open sewer lines. Perhaps this was the case because a choice was not given between clean walls or clean water. Participant one stated that only a few street people questioned the intent of the activity out of the hundreds that had stopped to inquire, assist, or provide food and water. Clean and presentable spaces matter to the public. The information proposes that the citizens of Karachi want a clean respectable habitable environment and would assist and support public space projects.

5.2.6 | Notable Concerns

The *notable concerns* section provides interesting insight on a few topics. Two examples are discussed below. Respondent 5 states that there is a “catastrophic lack of enterprise and creativity¹⁰⁶” in Karachi. The statement was not unexpected considering the absence of basic human needs throughout a good majority of the city. Lack of knowledge and appreciation of arts and culture was a common theme repeated on numerous occasions. What was unexpected, during

¹⁰⁶Rizvi, Former Deputy Chief of Party, DAL.

the data gathering process, was to hear repeatedly that everyday Karachiites had never witnessed a public space mural or campaign.

An additional interpretation of the findings suggests that the murals are one dimensional and not interactive, thereby limiting the effect of change. Respondent 8 was quite rigid in her view that interactivity was key to long-term learning. Yet, authors Knowles and Cole from chapter two suggest that the physical, emotional, spiritual, social, and cultural experience is accessed through oral, literal, visual, and embodied¹⁰⁷. Point being is that murals are interactive. In the case of the Walls of Peace murals they are positive visual stimulants and conversation starters. Moreover, they inspire thought and may generate a positive action.

5.3 | Implications of theory and research

My study offers suggestive evidence that arts-informed research methods may further enhance CVE/Resilience designs and strategies. Because the Walls of Peace activity was a tactic of a larger CVE/Resilience strategy it is difficult to assume what the co-creation process at the meta-level design phase would produce. However, these results should be taken into account, if and when, development practitioners were to explore alternative methods to CVE/Resilience program design. Arts-informed research methods did play a substantial role in design and planning.

The underpinning theory of change is a rigorous, yet participatory process whereby groups and stakeholders in a planning process articulate their long-term goals and identify the conditions they believe have to unfold for those goals to be met.¹⁰⁸ This case study demonstrates that the Walls of Peace activity was effective in applying their theory of change. The activity changed public

¹⁰⁷Knowles and Cole, *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Arts-Informed Research*.

perception based on their visual strategy depicting pride, ownership, hope and diversity. The visual strategy positioned local neighborhoods to transition from a negative peace to a positive. Where once negative wall-chalking content was strewn all over schools and city walls calling for ethnic, political and religious division are now covered with messages of pride, ownership, hope and diversity. The ripple effect of the Walls of Peace murals manifested into local resilience and unity amongst Karachiites.

Unfortunately, the researcher could not locate a CVE/Resilience study that was comparable to the Walls of Peace urban arts-based intervention. Therefore, the findings may not be consistent nor equivalent to other relatable CVE/Resilience studies. Nevertheless, the results from this study suggests that activities in which artists are at the forefront produce results that are dynamic because the arts are directly connected to the human condition.

5.4 | Limitations of research

The researcher did encounter limitations that may have expanded the results. I should stress that my study has been primarily concerned with the arts-based intervention component rather than the top down CVE/Resilience design approach. The lack of access to CVE/Resilience development practitioner and their assessment scheme proved to be challenging. The results of the study mostly exemplify the attributes and contributions of artists. However, this study does not reflect the interlocking process between development practitioners and arts-informed research methods.

In retrospect, perhaps the researcher may have designed this study to be mix methods. A quantitative component may have strengthened and better demonstrated the scale and impact the activity had throughout Karachi. The first phase of the activity painted over two-thousand five

hundred walls¹⁰⁹”. Also, a deeper look at demographic data may have presented further evidence of the ethnic divide. Statistical analysis may have also provided evidence that a reduction in physical violence occurred beginning in 2015.

My findings should not be read as evidence to promote a sudden shift in CVE/Resilience design or approach, but rather further exploration of the two disciplines. Hopefully, the findings may spark development practitioners to be further inclusive of non-traditional research methods when designing interventions.

5.5 | Recommendations

As the world becomes increasingly populated conflicts will increase. Social, economic, political and environmental drivers will force groups to encroach upon other groups resulting in cultural, political and ethnic tension, physical violence and miscommunication. It is logical to think that CVE/Resilience programming will only increase in many parts of the world.

International development agencies and non-governmental organizations could institutionalize arts-informed research methods as an additional tool for their response toolbox. As noted earlier, to understand complex human based problems, an on the ground presence is needed that can properly assess the complex environment. Moreover, methods and processes artists employ could very well be integrated into field manuals and policy documents.

With the advent of sensor technology and to further support quantitative inquiry future research could involve the placement of sensors within murals to monitor foot traffic. Monitoring the frequency of foot traffic and perhaps gauging how long an individual or group stands still before

¹⁰⁹ Adeela Suleman, Director, Fine Arts Department at Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture, interview by Researcher, Digital Audio Recording, April 23, 2019.

a mural could at the very least indicate a precise number of views that the mural is attracting. The data would also reflect the shelf life of visual narrative. Overtime do individuals become apathetic to visual narrative or do views remain constant.

An additional recommendation for future research within the CVE/Resilience frame may be a pilot program that unifies development practitioners and artist. Perhaps the two groups can learn from design and workflow process that is native to each individual group. This study demonstrates that both technical groups are committed to resolving ethnic, political and religious grievances. However their methods and technical language are quite different.

A final recommendation along the CVE/Resilience theme is for Karachi to join the Strong Cities Network. According to The Strong Cities Network their network is “designed for policy makers and practitioners working at the city, municipal or sub-national level.¹¹⁰” The network sponsors workshops to facilitate that sharing of knowledge, experiences and lessons learned. City officials who are members of the network meet to discuss challenges related to social cohesion and community resilience to prevent violent extremism. Additionally, the network raises awareness, discusses policy, programming and practice¹¹¹.

5.6 | Conclusion

Comprehending, synthesizing and executing interventions in complex environments is not an easy task. For every ethnic, political, religious dispute or bombing there is context and nuance. Moreover, CVE/Resilience programs seem to provide a broad response to address a hydra of

¹¹⁰ "Home," Strong Cities Network, accessed September 26, 2019, <https://strongcitiesnetwork.org/en/>.

¹¹¹ "Home."

sectoral issues. The aim of this study was to determine if an alternative optic, rooted in arts and culture could assist development professionals to address salient development issues.

This study examines an arts-based intervention in the heart of Karachi, Pakistan. The literature review delves into topics relating to the intervention, such as: arts-informed research methods, CVE/Resilience frameworks, communication strategy approaches and theoretical frameworks. From the review, existing literature seems to be stove-piped, however there were discoveries of collaboration amongst the disciplines. Everyday Peace indicators, STEAM and Human Centered Design suggest that local level inquiry, assessment and collaboration are generating an impact. Related, and not far behind, arts-informed research methods seem to be in concert with these approaches.

The methodology and theoretical framework applied to this study provided a sufficient level of organization and bases for inquiry that provided structure to this study. The qualitative inquiry was well suited to unpack assumptions, motives and practical change. The researcher traveled to Karachi and interviewed participants throughout multiple workflow streams. Additionally, the theory of change was an appropriate theoretical framework to investigate the planning, execution and post-evaluations of the activity. Visiting the physical mural locations added a dimension to the researcher's personal experience and subsequent field notes. Site location visits placed the challenge of executing the activity into perspective and scale. Moreover, reading pre-post-survey testimonials from everyday Karachiites further hit home how a particular medium of communication can cause significant harm.

The study demonstrates that wall-chalking was weaponized to further polarize an already divided society along political, ethnic and religious lines. However, what maybe more relevant is this study provides evidence that the power of a counter narrative campaign rooted in the arts, thoughtfully developed and strategically deployed, in conjunction with donor resources can be a very effective tool to mitigate CVE issues and to promote resilience amongst communities.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- “A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research,” n.d.
- “About.” Everyday Peace Indicators, May 6, 2013. <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/about/>.
- AFP. “Artists Reclaim Karachi Walls from Hate Graffiti.” DAWN.COM, July 25, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1196150>.
- Anonymous. Painter. Interview by Author. Digital Recording, May 2019.
- “Awardee Final Report.” Walls of Peace, December 2016.
- Azadi, Bahamin. “Art | Painted Politics: The Mural in Modern Iran.” FRONTLINE - Tehran Bureau, June 2012. <http://www.pbs.org/wgbh/pages/frontline/tehranbureau/2012/06/art-painted-politics-the-mural-in-modern-iran.html>.
- Azam, Maryam, and Umbreen Javaid. “The Sources of Militancy in Pakistan.” *Journal of the Research Society of Pakistan; Lahore* 54, no. 2 (December 2017). <http://search.proquest.com/docview/1994394640/abstract/D8AF9A2CBE4D4237PQ/1>.
- Beal, Graham W.J. “ART: Mutual Admiration, Mutual Exploitation: Rivera, Ford and the Detroit Industry Murals.” Text. Center for Latin American Studies (CLAS), June 23, 2014. <https://clas.berkeley.edu/research/art-mutual-admiration-mutual-exploitation-rivera-ford-and-detroit-industry-murals>.
- Bryman, Alan. *Social Research Methods*. 4th ed. Oxford ; New York: Oxford University Press, 2012.
- “Codebook-EPI Categories-May 2016.” Everyday Peace Indicators, May 2016. <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/codebooks/>.
- “Constructivism.” In *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Action Research*. 2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks, California 91320: SAGE Publications Ltd, 2014. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781446294406.n83>.
- Denoeux, Guilain, and Lynn Carter,. “Development-Assistance-and-Counter-Extremism-A-Programming-Guide-2009.” United States Agency for International Development, February 2009. <http://www.dmeforpeace.org/peacexchange/wp-content/uploads/2015/10/Development-Assistance-and-Counter-Extremism-A-Programming-Guide-2009-pdf.pdf>.

Epstein, Brian. "Social Ontology." In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N. Zalta, Summer 2018. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2018. <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/sum2018/entries/social-ontology/>.

"Everyday Peace Indicators » About." Accessed August 23, 2019. <https://everydaypeaceindicators.org/about/>.

"Field Notes." Author, May 2019.

Firchow, Pamina. "Everyday Peace Indicators." Everyday Peace Indicators, May 2016.

Flick, Uwe. *Designing Qualitative Research*. 1 Oliver's Yard, 55 City Road, London England EC1Y 1SP United Kingdom: SAGE Publications, Ltd, 2007. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781849208826>.

Freiband, Andrew. Artist Literacies Institute. Interview by Author. Digital Recording, June 21, 2019.

Freiband, Andrew. "Artists Literacies Institute." Artists' Literacies Institute. Accessed August 21, 2019. <https://www.artistsliteracies.org/about-us>.

"Home." Strong Cities Network. Accessed September 26, 2019. <https://strongcitiesnetwork.org/en/>.

"I Am Karachi: Walls of Peace Green Light Activity Grant Document." Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture, August 2016.

"In Wake of Protests, French Artist JR Pushes Hong Kong to Embrace Graffiti." *Dow Jones Institutional News; New York*. March 17, 2015. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/2069109164/citation/B4EDBD4E613542FDPQ/1>.

"Interpretivism." In *Encyclopedia of Evaluation*. 2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States of America: Sage Publications, Inc., 2005. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412950558.n289>.

Karachi Youth Initiative. "Karachi - Violent Extremism: Theory of Change." Karachi Youth Initiative Program, 2015.

Khan, Humera. "Why Countering Extremism Fails: Washington's Top-down Approach to Prevention Is Flawed." *Foreign Affairs*, February 2015.

Khan, Hussain Ali | Momina. "In Karachi: When Hate on the Wall Disappears." DAWN.COM, May 25, 2015. <http://www.dawn.com/news/1184142>.

- Khan, Zarina. "Painting the Town Positive – Fighting Extremism with Inspirational Art." Mvslim, June 6, 2015. <https://mvslim.com/painting-the-town-positive-fighting-extremism-with-inspirational-art/>.
- Khine, Myint Swe. *Steam Education: Theory and Practice*. New York, NY: Springer Berlin Heidelberg, 2019.
- Knowles, J. Gary, and Ardra L. Cole. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Arts-Informed Research*. 2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909>.
- "Lloyd's City Risk Index 2015-2025: Analysing the Economic Exposure from 18 Threats over Ten Years from 2015." Lloyd's, November 24, 2016. www.lloyds.com/cityriskindex.
- Mannay, Dawn. *Visual, Narrative and Creative Research Methods: Application, Reflection and Ethics*. 1st ed. Routledge, 2015. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315775760>.
- "Office of Transition Initiatives CVE Toolkit." USAID, Office of Transition Initiatives, February 2018.
- "Our City & the State of Its Walls." A Vasl Publication for I AM KARACHI, 2016.
- "Pakistan - State of Conflict and Violence." Asia Foundation, 2017. <https://asiafoundation.org/wp-content/uploads/2017/10/Pakistan-StateofConflictandViolence.pdf>.
- "PAKISTAN TEHSIL WISE FOR WEB CENSUS_2017.Pdf," n.d.
- "Pakistan-U.S. Alliance Evolves Post-9/11." PBS NewsHour, August 9, 2004. <https://www.pbs.org/newshour/show/pakistan-u-s-alliance-evolves-post-9-11>.
- "Preventing Violent Extremism (PVE) through Development." Swedish International Cooperation Development Agency (SIDA), n.d. www.sida.se.
- Rehman, Zia Ur. "Pakistan Security Report. Chapter 6: Killings in Karachi: Down, but Not Out." Pak Institute for Peace Studies (PIPS), 2016.
- Rizvi, Mashoud. Former Deputy Chief of Party, DAI. Digital Recording, May 2019.
- Ruby-Ling, Saronne. "The Detroit Murals of Diego Rivera." *History Today; London*, April 1996. <http://search.proquest.com/docview/202811532/abstract/9564602FD8284B48PQ/1>.
- Savin-Baden, Maggi. *A Practical Guide to Arts-Related Research*. Rotterdam: Sense, 2014.

Schensul, Jean J. *The SAGE Encyclopedia of Qualitative Research Methods: Methodology*. 2455 Teller Road, Thousand Oaks California 91320 United States: SAGE Publications, Inc., 2008. <https://doi.org/10.4135/9781412963909>.

“Snapshot.” Accessed July 27, 2019. <https://www.theoryofchange.org/what-is-theory-of-change/toc-background/toc-origins/>.

Steup, Matthias. “Epistemology.” In *The Stanford Encyclopedia of Philosophy*, edited by Edward N. Zalta, Winter 2018. Metaphysics Research Lab, Stanford University, 2018. <https://plato.stanford.edu/archives/win2018/entries/epistemology/>.

Sturgess, Patricia. “What Is Resilience?” Evidence on Demand, May 11, 2015. https://doi.org/10.12774/eod_tg.may2016.sturgessandsparrey.

Suleman, Adeela. Director, Fine Arts Department at Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture. Interview by Researcher. Digital Audio Recording, April 23, 2019.

———. Director, Fine Arts Department at Indus Valley School for Art and Architecture. Interview by Researcher. Digital Recording, April 23, 2019.

Syed, Munawar Ali. Lead painter: Walls of Peace. Interview by Author. Digital Recording, April 27, 2019.

Taplin, Ph.D., Dana, H., and Heléne Clark, Ph.D. “Theory of Change: A Primer on Theory of Change.” ActKnowledge, Inc., March 2012.

“Text of S. 962 (111th): Enhanced Partnership with Pakistan Act of 2009 (Passed the Senate Version).” GovTrack.us. Accessed September 25, 2019. <https://www.govtrack.us/congress/bills/111/s962/text>.

“The Field Guide to Human-Centered Design. Pdf.” IDEO.org San Francisco., 2015.

“TOC Origins.” Theory of Change Community. Accessed July 27, 2019. <https://www.theoryofchange.org/what-is-theory-of-change/toc-background/toc-origins/>.

“USAID CVE Toolkit.” Office of Transition Initiatives, February 2018.

VASL, House Photographer. “Image: Entrance Jinnah Hospital.” Walls of Peace, February 27, 2015.

———. “Image: ISIS graffiti.” VASL, July 18, 2016.

“Walls of Peace: Survey Notes.” Walls of Peace, December 2015.