

Should there be a Place for Spirituality in Business? Reflections on Spirituality of a Business Leader

Nowadays, in the Western world, many people are realising that there is more to profits in the economy. In a post-Enron world,² people have become aware of the importance of ethics in business and the values that are being exercised in the day-to-day leadership. At the same time, spirituality in business and the workplace has increased. In the introduction to their book, *Managing as if faith mattered*, Alford and Naughton, pointed out that:

Ten years ago [in 1991], questions of faith and spirituality seemed, confined to the private realm, discussed publicly only in churches or during retreats. Now, conferences, seminars, and workshops reveal an awakening to the importance of the religious and spiritual dimensions in all realms of life.³

Furthermore, a proliferation of books on this subject; some of which I have read, have and are still being published at a steady pace. These include: *The Seven Habits of Highly Effective People*; *Jesus CEO*; *Working from the Heart*; *The Soul of Business*; *Spirit at Work*; *Leading with Soul*; *Redefining the Corporate Soul*;

¹ David Cortis is an assistant lecturer in moral theology, especially in business ethics, at the Faculty of Theology at the University of Malta. He pursued his studies in commerce, accountancy, and later in theology at the University of Malta and the Pontifical University of Comillas, Madrid.

² A scandal, revealed in October 2001, eventually led to the largest bankruptcy reorganisation in American history at that time of the Enron Corporation, an American energy company.

³ Helen J. Alford and Michael J. Naughton, *Managing as if Faith Mattered* (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame, 2001), 2.

Lead like Jesus, Lessons from the Greatest Leadership Role Model of All Time; Jesus Entrepreneur; Jesus Life Coach; Leadership lessons of Jesus: A Timeless Model for Today's Leaders; The Leadership style of Jesus; Servant Leader; The Heart of a Leader: Insights on the Art of Influence; What Would the Buddha Do at Work?; The Corporate Mystic; Mother Teresa, CEO: Unexpected Principles for Practical Leadership; The Monk Who Sold His Ferrari: A Fable About Fulfilling Your Dreams & Reaching Your Destiny and many others. Likewise, there are guides and websites on these books with practical guidelines, motivational videos, day-to-day exercises, sharing of lessons that life has taught, etc. However, more often than not, authors try to construct a business ethic or spirituality of business from scratch. Some authors simply “mix and match” useful ideas from different, and even conflicting traditions of thought. Moreover, some consider spirituality as a means of increasing integrity, job satisfaction and motivation.

The Role of Business Leaders

For this article, the focus is on the entrepreneur, or better stated as the *business leader*, while also taking into consideration other players in the business institution. Business:

institutions are highly diverse, including cooperatives, multinational corporations, small entrepreneurial start-ups, employee-owned businesses, family businesses ... Some of these businesses are publicly traded stock companies, while most are privately held. Some have revenues larger than many countries, but most are small. Some are owned by thousands of investors, others are owned by a single person or family.⁴

Consequently, in a business institution there are different types of roles. There are the employees, the supervisors, the managers, other professional people, and naturally there is the *business leader*.

The focus on the business leader is of utmost importance when one takes into consideration that we are living in a world where there are about 47,000 listed companies on stock-exchange,⁵ consisting mostly of large companies, and an unquantified number of large non-listed companies, together with

⁴ Michael Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader: A Reflection* (Vatican / Minnesota: St. Paul - Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace, 2014), 5. Except where indicated, the numbers quoted refer to paragraphs and not to pages.

⁵ World Bank, “Listed domestic companies, total,” <http://data.worldbank.org/indicator/CM.MKT.LDOM.NO/countries/1W?display=graph>

approximately 125 million⁶ registered micro, small and medium companies, as well as many other non-registered companies. One must not leave out self-employed businesses from this complex network albeit these are not considered to be companies. It is also important to take into consideration the influence that a leader's leadership style, skills, capabilities and values will have, both directly and indirectly on other employees and the market players.⁷ Moreover, as noted by the United States Catholic Bishops, "securing economic justice depends heavily on the *leadership* of men and women in business and on wise investment by private enterprises."⁸

A business leader should refrain from putting his interests first and be genuinely responsible for the community, society and the country; that is to act as required to safeguard the common good.⁹ Even when talking to a person in a business institution, one must keep in mind that he is not just dealing with that individual but with a whole organization that has protocols and guidelines to handle things, policies and strategies that dictate how it functions within society.¹⁰

Furthermore, in business there are complex contexts that require good, cautious judgments "that are wise and rooted in reality and in truth."¹¹ Such judgments can be compared to a tree with roots. The roots are the theological grounding whilst the trunk represents the core principles and the branches

⁶ Khrystyna Kushnir, Melina Laura Mirmulstein and Rita Ramalho, "Micro, Small, and Medium Enterprises Around the World: How Many are There, and What Affects the Count?" <http://www.ifc.org/wps/wcm/connect/9ae1dd80495860d6a482b519583b6d16/MSME-CI-AnalysisNote.pdf?MOD=AJPERES>, (2010).

⁷ Empirical research has paid attention to the influence of religiosity, including Christianity, in several aspects of business. This includes making comparative studies between behaviour of Christians and other people, as well as the influence of Christian spirituality in managing and leading business. Yusuf Ahmed Nur and Dennis W. Organ, "Selected Organizational Outcome Correlates of Spirituality in the Workplace," *Psychological Reports* 98 (2006): 111-120.

⁸ United States Catholic Bishops, Pastoral Letter on Catholic Social Teaching and the U.S. Economy, *Economic Justice for All* (Washington: United States Catholic Bishops, 1986), 110. My emphasis.

⁹ Not every economist agrees with the term *common good*. It is also criticized, referring to it as the Tragedy of the Commons, amongst other things. However, there are particular economists, such as the 2009 Noble Prize only woman economist Elinor Ostrom, who proved that the commons do not have to end in tragedy. This article has a limitation as it did not delve into this issue.

¹⁰ See Carmen Ansotegui, Fernando Gómez-Bezares and Raúl González Fabre, *Ética de las finanzas* (Bilboa: Desclée de Brouwer, 2014), 175.

¹¹ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 27.

signify the secondary principles. Lastly, the leaves symbolise the situations encountered in business which require the application of good judgement. However, “the ability to make reasoned judgments...must be nurtured in the moral and spiritual culture from which business leaders come, namely their families, religion, educational institutions and the larger communities to which they belong. For the Christian business leader, at the heart of that culture is the Gospel of Jesus Christ.”¹² Moreover, as pointed out by Cardinal Bertone:

The business leader is not a speculator, but essentially an innovator. The speculator makes it his goal to maximize profit; for him, business is merely a means to an end, and that end is profit. For the speculator, building roads and establishing hospitals or schools is not the goal, but merely a means to the goal of maximum profit. It should be immediately clear that the speculator is not the model of business leader that the Church holds up as an agent and builder of the common good.¹³

On the contrary, the business leader should be an “innovator,” an agent and also a builder of common good.

Real Examples of Business Leaders

Having defined the role of the business leader, it is now worth taking a look at some instances in the business world where companies have applied some form of spiritual practice for various reasons, such as for guidance in decision-making or to prepare for tough situations. Some practical examples include: *Timberland Shoes* CEO who uses his prayer book and religious beliefs to guide him in business decisions and company policy making, apart from consulting his rabbi on regular bases. The CEO of *Bio Genex* uses the Hindu holy text to steer his business out of trouble. In the *American Stock Exchange* there is a Torah study group. The plane manufacturing giant; *Boeing* has Christian, Muslim and Jewish prayer groups whilst *Microsoft* has an on-line prayer service. Companies such as *Apple*, *Google*, *Yahoo*, *IBM*, *Cisco*, and *Prentice-Hall* have meditation classes, where some give hours on company time to pray, as it was found that such practices improve productivity and creativity. Others resort to meditation to come up with ideas, projects and company names. Another interesting fact is that executives of *Xerox* have gone on week-long retreats.

¹² Ibid., 27.

¹³ Tarcisio Bertone, “Address Secretary of State for the Opening of the Executive Summit on Ethics for the Business World,” http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/secretariat_state/card-bertone/2011/documents/rc_seg-st_20110616_business-ethics_en.html.

The following are further real examples of good role models in the business world. One can easily encounter other examples:

James E. Burke was the CEO of pharmaceutical giant Johnson & Johnson when the Tylenol poison crisis hit the firm in 1982. Seven people in Chicago died when they used Tylenol capsules that had been emptied and filled with cyanide. Burke is widely credited for immediately withdrawing the capsules (at a cost of 100 million dollars), and for being very honest with all the stakeholders and the media. He said that the J&J Credo states at its very beginning that: "our first responsibility is to the doctors, nurses, and patients and to mothers and all others who use our products," and admitted that these were the words which inspired him to do the immediate, expensive recall. Burke and J&J gained immense stature with the public because of the way they handled the crisis.

Burke later reflected upon his and the company's decisions: "All we did was what we thought any responsible company would have done in our position - and people reacted as if this were some radical new departure for American business. My God, what did people expect we'd do? The amount of mistrust and cynicism out there is really depressing."

During the 1980s CEO Burke resisted pressure from Wall Street for constant quarterly earning increments and instead made long-term investments that have paid off handsomely in new products and he also succeeded at taking J&J to China and Russia. After retiring from J&J, Burke became president of the Business Enterprise Trust, an organization of business leaders that identifies business firms which are especially responsible from year to year. The Trust selected at least five firms each year, held them up as models of virtuous behaviour in business and publicized their acts, both through written testimonies and videos for business school students. Burke says that he learned more that is helpful to him in business through his undergraduate liberal arts program at Jesuit College of the Holy Cross in Worcester, Mass., than he did at the Harvard Business School.¹⁴

Other examples are:

- Lour Giuliano, the former boss of ITT Industries, used to have a plaque in his office that read, "Bidden or not bidden, God is present."
- The relentlessly entrepreneurial Wayne Huizenga said that he prays for his employees almost every day.

¹⁴ Gerald F. Cavanagh and Mark R. Bandsuch, "Virtue as a Benchmark for Spirituality in Business," *Journal of Business Ethics* 38 (2002): 109-112, 115.

- The former CEO of Alaska Airlines encouraged his caterers to place cards with Bible verses on every meal tray.
- Tom Monaghan reserved an entire wing of the Domino's office complex in Anna Arbor, Michigan, for Catholic apostolates, including the Thomas More Society, the Spiritus Sanctus Academies, and Legatus.
- Mark Dillon, the president of Tampa Bay Steel Corporation, tries to solve difficult corporate problems - what should he do about a delinquent customer? Should he sack an underperforming employee? - by consulting the Bible.¹⁵
- Mark Weinberger, the CEO of Ernest and Young (EY), which is one of the four biggest audit firms in the world, pointed out in a speech, that EY was working hard to change their culture both because it is the right thing to do and because it is a smart business move to make. Like most major financial firms, EY has a turnover problem among mid-career working parents. It is also combatting an industry-wide culture of overwork and employs many millennials who are increasingly demanding flexibility. Furthermore, it is a business that depends upon the talent and dedication of its employees. Before Weinberger became CEO, he discussed the opportunity with his wife and four children. His family agreed that he could take the job only if he remained a highly-involved dad. Shortly after becoming CEO, he was in China giving his first big speech to the EY employees there, along with many business partners and government officials. He was nervous about the speech and wanted it to be memorable. A big dinner reception was to be held afterwards. However, Weinberger ended his speech with an apology. He stated that he would have to skip the reception to catch the next plane home so that he could take his daughter to her driver's test. He explained that he had promised his daughter to do so a year before and felt the need to stay true to his word in honour of his commitment to his family.¹⁶

Fragmentation and Compartmentalization

Such observable good traits of leadership give hope. However, in today's reality and the daily life events one encounters, there can be cases where one finds himself obsessing over his own personal life and focusing solely on his own interests and concerns. The repercussion is that such a person leaves no

¹⁵ The examples quoted taken from John Micklethwait and Adrian Wooldridge, *God is Back: How the Global Revival of Faith is Changing the World* (New York: Penguin Books, 2009).

¹⁶ See "Leading by Example: EY's CEO Mark Weinberger on Work and Family," <http://fathersworkandfamily.com/2014/07/09/leading-by-example-ey-ceo-mark-weinberger-on-work-and-family/>.

room for others in his life.¹⁷ There is also, “activity undertaken badly, without adequate motivation, without a spirituality which would permeate it and make it pleasurable,”¹⁸ thus work becomes unrewarding and tiring. Meanwhile, there is also a call for individuals to take the initiative on a personal level to mind the gap that exists between faith and ethics, between spirituality and morality. This is the *divided life*. “This split between faith and daily business practice can lead to imbalances and misplaced devotion to worldly success.”¹⁹ This is “the split between the faith which many profess and their daily lives.”²⁰

One can mention various real life examples, including that of Joseph P. Nacchio, former chairman and CEO of Quest Communications, and L. Dennis Kozlowski, former CEO of Tyco International, both of whom claimed Roman Catholic affiliations but faced media scrutiny of their business ethics.²¹ Kozlowski, along with other senior officers of Tyco, was charged with violations of federal securities laws by the Securities and Exchange Commission. He also dragged Seton Hall University into the controversy, which is his Alma Mater and to which he has been a generous benefactor.²² Former CEO of Enron, Kenneth Lay, was forced to resign amid federal investigations for fraud.²³ These examples, amongst many others, are a reminder for business leaders “into believing, falsely, that their professional lives are incompatible with their spiritual lives.”²⁴ Thus, the business leaders “risk valuing status and fame over lasting accomplishment, and consequently risk losing their good judgment.”²⁵

This gap is what Alford and Naughton called “fragmentation,”²⁶ whilst MacIntyre referred to it as “compartmentalization.”²⁷ Fragmentation “arises from a divided life or a split personality - that is, embracing a distinct set of

¹⁷ See Pope Francis, Apostolic Exhortation *Evangelii Gaudium* [EG], 24 November 2013, 2. http://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/apost_exhortations/documents/papa-francesco_esortazione-ap_20131124_evangelii-gaudium.html

¹⁸ *Ibid.*, no. 82.

¹⁹ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, Executive Summary, 2.

²⁰ Vatican Council II, Pastoral Constitution *Gaudium et spes* [GS], 43.

²¹ See “How Tyco’s CEO Enriched Himself,” *Wall Street Journal* 113 (7 August 2002): 1.

²² See John Byrne, “Seton Hall of Shame?,” *Business Week Online*, 20 September 2002, <http://www.bloomberg.com/bw/stories/2002-09-19/seton-hall-of-shame>.

²³ See “High Profiles in Hot Water,” *Wall Street Journal* 113 (28 June, 2002): B1

²⁴ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 12.

²⁵ *Ibid.*

²⁶ Alford and Naughton, *Managing as if Faith Mattered*, 7.

²⁷ Alisdair MacIntyre, *A Culture of Choices and Compartmentalization*, <http://brandon.multics.org/library/Alasdair%20MacIntyre/macintyre2000choices.html>.

values at work and another set in non-work or private milieu.”²⁸ “Constantly changing masks creates a disjoint within the person”²⁹ and at the extreme, it may even cause one to lose his soul, through a disconnection from his inner self, as one switch off his conscience in some spheres of his life.³⁰ On the other hand, compartmentalization refers to the manner by which individuals have managed to separate and live within distinct spheres. Naughton argues that “when work is separated from our faith, we are denying the image in which we were created, which is the beginning of denying our end in salvation.”³¹ This leads to the distancing of oneself from his actions. Wolfe and Roels summarised this in the following statement:

Faith and work can be compatible, personally and spiritually rewarding, as well as be a means for responding to God’s gift of love and relationship. Yet the potential for serious disconnects between early personal spiritual formation and corporate leadership must be recognized. Sometimes the loosening of connections begins in business school where subtle messages about corporate mission and ethical responsibility undermine faith-based values and perspectives on business. The disconnect can become greater if powerful corporate cultures are not complemented by other sources of accountability and ongoing faith formation that assist individuals in living out their vocational identity.³²

Non-Theistic Accounts of Spirituality

With the presence of fragmentation and compartmentalization as challenges in today’s world and in the business scenario, there are different points of views that arise both from a theistic and a non-theistic form of spirituality. A particular non-theistic movement is the spiritual management development (SMD). In an article, Bell and Taylor tried to identify the theoretical foundations and practical features

²⁸ Cristine Atienza; Maria A. Santiago, “Role of Business Leaders in the Integrality of the Working Individual,” *De La Salle University Business Notes and Briefings* 1/3 (2013): 1.

²⁹ Alford and Naughton, *Managing as if Faith Mattered*, 7.

³⁰ See Michael J. Naughton, “A Divided Life: One of the More Serious Errors for the Christian Professional,” in *Scrutinizing the Signs of the Times and Interpreting them in Light of the Gospel*, ed. Johan Verstraeten (Louvain: Peeters Publishers, 2006), 1-16.

³¹ Michael J. Naughton, “The Corporation as a Community of Work: Understanding the Firm Within the Catholic Social Tradition,” *Ave Maria Law Review* 4 (2006): 42.

³² Regina Wentzel Wolfe and Shirley Roels, “Roman Catholic and Protestant Perspectives on Business as a Calling: Managerial Leadership in the Corporate Square,” in *Business as a Calling, Interdisciplinary Essays on the Meaning of Business from the Catholic Social Tradition*, eds. Michael Naughton and Stephanie Rumpza (St. Paul, Minnesota: Center for Catholic Studies, 2004), 25 (online edition: <https://www.stthomas.edu/media/catholicstudies/center/documents/businessasacallingpdf/14WolfeRoels.pdf>).

of SMD following religious keywords that diffused in the management field. There is a discourse dominated by intrinsic motivation, commitment, empowerment, personal growth and self-actualization which leads to various programmes in a holistic approach, recognizing and cultivating spirituality. The SMD focuses on the meaning and significance of existence, making it implicitly religious whilst not necessarily drawing directly on religious belief.³³ SMD is a term used “to refer to the wide variety of seminars, workshops, and training courses that employ a discourse based on self-fulfilment, self-discovery and self-development in relation to managerial work.”³⁴ The goals of SMD are “personal growth and self-creation, rather than self-knowledge or knowledge about the organisation,”³⁵ “search for meaning and explore feelings of solidarity and re-identification with their work roles and work organisation.”³⁶ SMD employs different techniques which are dominated by New Age movement, focusing on the self as the key to personal and corporate salvation while putting forward the believe that spirituality can be practiced in the business world in a ‘pick and mix’ approach. Bell and Taylor suggest that SMD “provides a place of temporary retreat from the difficulties and uncertainties of work life where individuals can seek security and try to overcome the feelings of separateness and isolation they experience in the workplace.”³⁷ Furthermore “the rejection of rational knowledge and denial of social structure leads towards a praxis that turns organizational issues into spiritual ones for which the individual is responsible.”³⁸ There is no reference to deity.

Moreover, in a paper, which reviewed a 140 papers on spirituality at work, to explore how spirituality improves employees’ performances and organizational effectiveness; Karakas pointed out that through the literature reviewed, it became apparent that there exist three different perspectives on how spirituality benefits employees and supports organizational performance. These are that: a) Spirituality enhances employees’ well-being and quality of life; b) Spirituality provides employees with a sense of purpose and meaning at work; c) Spirituality provides employees with a sense of interconnectedness and community.³⁹ The

³³ See Emma Bell and Scott Taylor, “‘From Outward Bound to Inward Bound:’ The Prophetic Voices and Discursive Practices of Spiritual Management Development,” *Human Relations* 57(2004): 439-466, 440-443.

³⁴ *Ibid.*, 441.

³⁵ *Ibid.*

³⁶ *Ibid.*

³⁷ *Ibid.*, 460.

³⁸ *Ibid.*, 462.

³⁹ See Fahri Karakas, “Spirituality and Performance in Organizations: A Literature Review,” *Journal of Business Ethics* 94 (2010): 89-106.

author also pointed out that “to achieve successful integration of spirituality at work, major concerns and caveats of bringing spirituality at work should be adequately addressed.” These caveats include openness and freedom of expression and acknowledgement of employees as whole persons.⁴⁰ As Karakas concluded, “in the 21st century, organizations need to incorporate a set of humanistic and spiritual values into workplaces to enable human hearts, spirits and souls to grow and flourish.”⁴¹ These studies show signs of positivity and hope for business activity, and provide a good ground for dialogue from a theistic spirituality point of view.

Meanings of Theistic Spirituality that can Help Business Professionals

Max Weber’s work, *Protestant ethic and the spirit of capitalism*, is one of the first texts to make an explicit connection between business activity and spiritual practice with reference to deity. In fact, the relationship between Protestantism and capitalism is shown in his famous treatise, in which he explains where and how Protestantism has influenced the contemporary attitudes of work. Weber argued that the asceticism of Protestantism played a significant role in the development of capitalism. Many changes have occurred since 1930 when the treatise was written till today. In this regard, in today’s world, as Heather Höpfl points out:

Spirituality has become a matter of personal preference and choice, has become a self-indulgent concern with personal spiritual well-being. There is no allegiance to a community and no sense of collective responsibility. There is little or no understanding of the importance of discernment in moral matters, nor collective celebration which is not primarily self-referential.⁴²

This statement points out the challenges whilst asserting that there exists a relationship and close connection between spirituality and morality in a theistic form.

To this, questions arise regarding the meaning and definition of spirituality and its connection to the business activity, which is in itself a moral activity. Spirituality is the source of moral life on which the actions we take are founded. Hence, morality and spirituality cannot be separated into two different areas. Spirituality affects and shapes the moral person, the person’s character, the

⁴⁰ Ibid.

⁴¹ Ibid., 104.

⁴² Heather Höpfl, “Catholicism: Incarnation and Remembrance of the Body,” in *Belief and Organization*, eds. Peter Case et al. (Hampshire: Palgrave Macmillan, 2002), 109.

powers that modify the person and the moral deliberation. Virtue leads to action, providing a sensitivity and inclination to do the right thing.⁴³ Spirituality without morality is incorporeal and morality without spirituality is rootless. Thus, spirituality is a search for inner identity, connectedness and transcendence.

Having said this, William C. Spohn makes a difference between “lived spirituality” and “reflective spirituality.”

Lived spirituality, analogous to morality, refers to the practice of transformative, affective, practical, and holistic disciplines that seek to connect the person with reality’s deepest meanings. It is concerned not primarily with isolated experiences such as visions or insights, but with a way of life that consciously seeks to live in tune with ultimate or comprehensive realities.⁴⁴

On the other hand, for Spohn:

Reflective spirituality, analogous to ethics, stands for the second-order interpretation and communication of this dimension of experience as experience. It employs theological, historical-contextual, artistic, anthropological, and hermeneutical methods to analyse the lived experience.⁴⁵

This aids further reflection upon our theme since it provides insight on the different meanings and types of spirituality.

Reflection on all of this, derives the question, that Rossouw, asked over twenty years ago, when he wrote the article: “Business Ethics: Where Have All the Christians Gone?”⁴⁶ In the mentioned article, the author surmised the integration between spirituality and ethics and noticed that at that time few Christian proposals for business ethics were presented. He argued that postmodern culture offers theology an opportunity to get re-involved in the world of business, thus re-establishing a close connection between spirituality (in a theistic form) and business. In this regard, from a Catholic point of view and according to Höpfl, spirituality “is the way in which the individual and the community of the Church relate to the deity.”⁴⁷ Interestingly, Höpfl compares the Easter rite with the individual and the organisation, the individual and the *shared* culture and the desire for shared commitments. He demonstrates that “it

⁴³ See Richard M. Gula, *The Good Life: Where Morality and Spirituality Converge* (Mahwah: Paulist Press, 1999).

⁴⁴ William C. Spohn, “Spirituality and Ethics: Exploring the Connections,” *Theological Studies* 58 (1997): 112.

⁴⁵ Ibid.

⁴⁶ Gedeon J. Rossouw, “Business Ethics: Where Have All the Christians Gone?,” *Journal of Business Ethics* 13 (1994): 557-570.

⁴⁷ Höpfl, “Catholicism: Incarnation and Remembrance of the Body,” 110.

is a service without the more usual celebration of the Eucharist which binds a congregation to a common purpose,⁴⁸ where “the experience is individual but guided by a common intention: a higher order of authority.”⁴⁹

However, both feet on the ground, as Pope Francis pointed out, “the return to the sacred and the quest for spirituality which mark our own time are ambiguous phenomena.”⁵⁰ At the same time, “whenever we say that something is ‘spirited,’ it usually refers to some interior impulse which encourages, motivates, nourishes and gives meaning to our individual and communal activity.”⁵¹

As Pope Francis brought to the fore, in some places and maybe also in businesses, “a spiritual ‘desertification’ has evidently come about, as the result of attempts by some societies to build without God or to eliminate their Christian roots.”⁵² It is a risk where Catholics, including business leaders, are “being challenged by the proliferation of new religious movements, some of which tend to fundamentalism while others seem to propose a spirituality without God,”⁵³ which is a “human reaction to a materialistic, consumerist and individualistic society.”⁵⁴

As already outlined above, in the spiritual practices that are being carried out in some businesses, there is the “immanentism”⁵⁵ that expresses a “false autonomy which has no place for God,”⁵⁶ and which can take “the form of a spiritual consumerism tailored to one’s own unhealthy individualism,”⁵⁷ with the risk of ending up “by being taken in by solutions which neither make life truly human nor give glory to God,”⁵⁸ as individuals try to satisfy their thirst for transcendence and for God with “alienating solutions or with a disembodied Jesus who demands nothing of them with regard to others.”⁵⁹ This leads to “various forms of a ‘spirituality of well-being’ divorced from any community

⁴⁸ Ibid., 112.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ *EG* 89.

⁵¹ Ibid., 261.

⁵² Ibid., 86.

⁵³ Ibid., 63.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Ibid., 89.

⁵⁶ Ibid.

⁵⁷ Ibid.

⁵⁸ Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

life”⁶⁰ and a “spiritual worldliness”⁶¹ with “an obsession with programmes of self-help and self-realization.”⁶²

Such a gap, the divided life, compartmentalization and fragmentation happen to business leaders, as they do to other believers. Thus, the call made by the United States Catholic Bishops in 1986 which is still timely in today’s world although it goes back to more than 30 years ago:

We need a spirituality which calls forth and supports lay initiative and witness not just in our churches but also in business, in the labour movement, in the professions, in education, and in public life. Our faith is not just a weekend obligation, a mystery to be celebrated around the altar on Sunday. It is a pervasive reality to be practiced every day in homes, offices, factories, schools, and businesses across our land. We cannot separate what we believe from how we act in the marketplace and the broader community, for this is where we make our primary contribution to the pursuit of economic justice.⁶³

Meanwhile, the Pontifical Council for Justice and Peace document, *Vocation of the business leader*, outlines that:

Fortunately, new movements and programs have been developed in an effort to take moral and spiritual life more seriously in relation to business. Faith-and-work groups, spirituality of work programs, business ethics training and social responsibility projects, are all helping business leaders to manage their companies in the spirit of St. Paul’s exhortation: ‘But test everything; hold fast what is good’ (*1 Thes 5,21*). Many of these groups and movements are enabling business leaders to recognise their work as a vocation and the role their businesses play in contributing to the common good.⁶⁴

Here, the document is referring to the Economy of Communion from the Focolare movement, UNIAPAC, Legatus, Woodstock Business Conference, *Compagnia delle Opere* from the Communion and Liberation movement, as well as other movements that take the relationship of faith and business seriously. Their aim, the teleological goal is the common good, where their love is expressed in contributing to the wellbeing of others in the community. This brings hope to the business leader.

At the same time, curiously enough, the word “spirituality” rarely appears in Catholic social teachings, while its assumptions are woven throughout. The

⁶⁰ Ibid., 90.

⁶¹ Ibid., 95.

⁶² Ibid.

⁶³ United States Catholic Bishops, *Economic Justice for All*, 25.

⁶⁴ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 25.

principles of the Catholic social teaching are rooted in the dignity of every human person and bring us together as a community, while creating relationships of love and respect. These principles are born of “the encounter of the Gospel message and of its demands summarized in the supreme commandment of love of God and neighbour in justice with the problems emanating from the life of society.”⁶⁵ “The spirituality assumed in Catholic social thought revolves around the understanding of God’s involvement in the world through humans as well as the human response to the divine initiative,”⁶⁶ where thus the connection between spirituality and morality is intertwined.

Vocation of a Business Leader from a Christian Perspective

Having reviewed meanings of spirituality, a delving point on the business leader is important before arguing about how Christian spirituality can be of help to a business leader. In view of this, some questions arise: How is the business leader viewed from a Christian perspective? How are we going to dialogue with business leaders? What is the role of the ordinary pastoral ministry in all this? What is the role of the Church? Pope Francis pointed out that “ordinary pastoral ministry seeks to help believers to grow spiritually so that they can respond to God’s love ever more fully in their lives.”⁶⁷ It is an invitation to accompany other believers, including those who have the vocation of business leaders, who want to advance in spiritual life and thus “constantly be missionaries.”⁶⁸ Business leaders qualify as missionaries as well because “business is a vocation, and a noble vocation, provided that those engaged in it see themselves challenged by a greater meaning in life; this will enable them truly to serve the common good by striving

⁶⁵ Congregation for the Doctrine of the Faith, *Instruction on Christian Freedom and Liberation* *Libertatis conscientia*, 72. http://www.vatican.va/roman_curia/congregations/cfaith/documents/rc_con_cfaith_doc_19860322_freedom-liberation_en.html.

⁶⁶ Michael H. Crosby, “Spirituality,” in *The New Dictionary of Catholic Social Thought*, ed. Judith A. Dwyer (Collegeville: Michael Glazier, 1994), 918.

⁶⁷ *EG* 15.

⁶⁸ See *ibid.*, no. 272: “When we live out a spirituality of drawing nearer to others and seeking their welfare, our hearts are opened wide to the Lord’s greatest and most beautiful gifts. Whenever we encounter another person in love, we learn something new about God. Whenever our eyes are opened to acknowledge the other, we grow in the light of faith and knowledge of God. If we want to advance in the spiritual life, then, we must constantly be missionaries. The work of evangelization enriches the mind and the heart; it opens up spiritual horizons; it makes us more and more sensitive to the workings of the Holy Spirit, and it takes us beyond our limited spiritual constructs. A committed missionary knows the joy of being a spring which spills over and refreshes others.”

to increase the goods of this world and to make them more accessible to all;”⁶⁹ thus emphasising equal access to all.

In itself, business is a vocation as “when businesses and markets as a whole are functioning properly and are regulated in an effective manner by government, they make an *irreplaceable contribution* to the material and even *spiritual well-being of humankind*.”⁷⁰ Hence, taking all this into consideration, the spiritual accompaniment leads others, including business leaders, ever closer to God, in whom they attain true freedom.⁷¹ Furthermore, “the calling of the entrepreneur must be considered within the more comprehensive call to holiness.”⁷² There is the example of Blessed Giuseppe Tovini, a businessman and banker from Brescia, who used to say “without faith, your children will never be rich; with faith they will never be poor.” This makes Tovini an excellent role-model in the business world amongst others, because he eloquently proves that not all business men and business endeavours are bad, as people seem to believe.

And what is the view of the Catholic Church on business? In relation to this, Pope Pius XII made a significant contribution to the formulation of the Catholic social tradition on the nature and purpose of the enterprise, by incorporating the spiritual and moral resources of the social tradition - that is, the social nature of property and its private ownership, the role of virtue, the idea of communities of people, and so forth.⁷³

However, it was only in 1983, in the Encyclical *Sollicitudo Rei Socialis*, that the word “entrepreneur” actually appeared for the first time in a papal social encyclical. To be an entrepreneur is a special gift, a gift from God. Here:

Pope John Paul II viewed enterprise as an activity of God the Creator whose image is impressed upon humanity. This image is clearly expressed in the abilities of men and women to combine *intellectus* (mind), *res* (material things) and *opera* (work) to produce goods and services that *enhance* and *fulfil* the human persons within community.⁷⁴

⁶⁹ Ibid., 203.

⁷⁰ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 2. My emphasis.

⁷¹ See EG 170.

⁷² William J. Toth, “The Entrepreneurial Calling: Perspectives from Rahner,” in *Business as a Calling*, 1. (online edition: <https://www.stthomas.edu/media/catholicstudies/center/documents/businessasacallingpdf/04Toth.pdf>).

⁷³ See Jean-Yves Calvez and Michael J. Naughton, “Catholic Social Teaching and the Purpose of the Business Organization,” in *Rethinking the Purpose of Business*, eds. Stephen A. Cortright and Michael J. Naughton (Notre Dame: University of Notre Dame Press, 2002), 9.

⁷⁴ Toth, “The Entrepreneurial Calling,” 2-3. My emphasis.

This enhancement and fulfilment of the human person is one of the aims that needs to be achieved for the common good. Pope John Paul II treated enterprise and the role of the entrepreneur as a right subsumed under the right to personal economic initiative and even considered this right to be co-equal to the right of religious liberty.

Furthermore, in talks to managers, entrepreneurs and professionals, Pope John Paul II has insisted that entrepreneurship is a form of social service, a service to all. In an address to the entrepreneurs of Milan, Pope John Paul II remarked: “the degree of well-being that society enjoys today would have been impossible without the dynamic figure of the entrepreneur, whose function consists in organizing human labour and the means of production in order to produce goods and services.”⁷⁵ The entrepreneur also balances and adjusts to market needs, worker expectations and the demands of correct business management.⁷⁶ Most importantly, an entrepreneur is a steward of the resources of a nation. “These resources are not to be possessed but to serve labour and ultimately, to be made available to all in society,”⁷⁷ thus men or women for others. The economic activity is also called upon to contribute to the work of salvation in Jesus Christ, as the economic work contributes to the building of the Kingdom.

This economic activity reflects the theological dimensions of the Trinity. Although Karl Rahner had not written on entrepreneurship *per se*, following his theological writings one can attain a Rahnerian theology of entrepreneurship. The first base-point lies “in the creative and providential mission of the Father.”⁷⁸ This love is concertized in the kenotic risk of the Son. The second theological base-point for the entrepreneur - one which underscores the depth of his or her risk - can be found in the “searching Christology” of Rahner, where Christ illuminates the depths of self-emptying love upon which all human risk is grounded. A final and most significant characteristic of the entrepreneurial vocation can be drawn from Rahner’s understanding of the Holy Spirit.⁷⁹

For Rahner, the manifestation of creativity is just the first phase of the Holy Spirit’s activity. The circle of the Holy Spirit’s activity becomes complete when the “entrepreneur-creator” of the breakthrough acknowledges and surrenders personally to the uncreated Creator as the ultimate source all human creativity. In

⁷⁵ Pope John Paul II, “Address to the Entrepreneurs of Milan” (22 May 1983), *L’Osservatore Romano* 15 (30 May 1983): 5.

⁷⁶ See *ibid.*

⁷⁷ Toth, “The Entrepreneurial Calling,” 3.

⁷⁸ *Ibid.*, no. 7.

⁷⁹ See *ibid.*, no. 10.

that process, not just the work of the entrepreneur but the entrepreneur is blessed. At that moment he or she becomes *kainon* - a new creation. At that moment the entrepreneur has accomplished the basic human task which, according to Rahner, is to surrender to transcendental order of truth and value whose ground is God.⁸⁰

Therefore, the three key works are “creative and providential mission,” “self-emptying love,” and “new creation.” Having established this, one may ask: What is the role of the Church in all this? “The place of the Church is to provide business leaders with fundamental and practical principles to consider in their decisions, but not to prescribe particular courses of action.”⁸¹ In a message sent by Pope Francis to the Executive Chairman of the World Economic Forum on the occasion of the Annual Meeting at Davos-Klosters (Switzerland), Pope Francis pointed out that:

The international business community can count on many men and women of great personal honesty and integrity, whose work is inspired and guided by high ideals of fairness, generosity and concern for the authentic development of the human family. I urge you to draw upon these great human and moral resources and to take up this challenge with determination and far-sightedness. Without ignoring, naturally, the specific scientific and professional requirements of every context, I ask you to ensure that humanity is served by wealth and not ruled by it.⁸²

Thus, a Christian ethic and spirituality, essentially based upon fellowship with Jesus Christ, favour these ideals and concern for an authentic development of human family. “Without receptivity [and interiority] in their lives, business leaders can be tempted...to regard themselves as *determining* and *creating* their own principles, not as receiving them.”⁸³ “Christian business leaders are men and women of action who have demonstrated an authentic entrepreneurial spirit, one that recognises the God-given responsibility to accept the vocation of business generously and faithfully.”⁸⁴

These leaders are motivated by much more than financial success, enlightened self-interest, or an abstract social contract as is often prescribed by economic literature and management textbooks. Faith enables Christian business leaders

⁸⁰ Ibid., no. 11.

⁸¹ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 74.

⁸² Pope Francis, “Message to the Executive Chairman of the World Economic Forum on the Occasion of the Annual Meeting at Davos-Klosters (Switzerland),” https://w2.vatican.va/content/francesco/en/messages/pont-messages/2014/documents/papa-francesco_20140117_messaggio-wef-davos.html

⁸³ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 66.

⁸⁴ Ibid., 61.

to see a much larger world, a world in which God is at work, and where their individual interests and desires are not the sole driving force.

Bridging the Gap

Following this review on different meanings of spirituality (theistic and non-theistic), the challenges in spirituality, business *per se*, the business leader and the role of the Church, a thought-provoking quote provided in the document *Vocation of a business leader* states that:

When business leaders integrate the gifts of the spiritual life, the virtues and ethical social principles into their life and work, they may overcome the divided life and receive the grace to foster the integral development of all business stakeholders. The Church calls upon business leaders to *receive* - humbly acknowledging what God has done for them - and to *give* - entering into communion with others to make the world a better place. *Practical wisdom* informs their approach to business and strengthens business leaders to respond to the world's challenges not with fear or cynicism, but with the virtues of faith, hope and love.⁸⁵

This is a call to receive and give, through a journey of faith, hope and love. It is a call to overcome fragmentation and compartmentalization which challenge our spirituality. Furthermore, it is a call for the Church to accompany, where business is viewed in an integrated approach. Interestingly, Verstraeten tried to explain how “Christians are called to affirm a *difference* in business and that as such they become relevant as a source of moral innovation and transformation towards more humanity.”⁸⁶ This is different from a self-centred business leader. “The moral life of Christians cannot be practiced without discipleship.”⁸⁷ All this discourse about the “calling” of business:

Can give the impression that one can easily merge the rationality of business with the ethico-religious language of ‘vocation’ or ‘calling.’ This is quite problematic since the world of business and the sciences related to it (management theories, business ethics) are affected by the differentiation process of modernity.⁸⁸

⁸⁵ Ibid., 3.

⁸⁶ Johan Verstraeten, “How Faith Makes a Difference: Business as a Calling or the Calling of Christians in Business?,” in *Business as a Calling* (online edition: <https://www.stthomas.edu/media/catholicstudies/center/documents/businessasacallingpdf/02Verstraeten.pdf>) 1.

⁸⁷ Alain Thomasset, *Paul Ricoeur: Une poétique de la morale* (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 1996), 208.

⁸⁸ Verstraeten, “How Faith Makes a Difference,” 2.

Furthermore, one must provide an answer to the following impeding question: How does one articulate the unifying spirit of an enterprise inspired by one's faith while at the same time respecting the diversity that its success ushers in?⁸⁹

Christian life leads to a hermeneutic interruption of business since Christians are not only "citizens" of the world of business and its hermeneutic horizon, but they also have access to another horizon of interpretation which is quite different. The point is not, as McCann has suggested, that Christians have access to a hermeneutical horizon which is "older" than the horizon of modernity with its instrumental rationality⁹⁰, but rather, that it is a *different* horizon. This is because:

Christians cultivate a hermeneutic relationship to an interpreting community and an ethos that is *different* than that of modernity and its forms of instrumental and managerial rationality, they are [*sic*] able to discover ethical and meta-ethical perspectives that can break through the dominance of this type of rationality and social organization which is coupled with it, as well as it enables them to break through the narrow angle of 'problem solving' (seeking solution on the basis of the analysis of problems instead of on the basis of innovative new perspectives).⁹¹

New Perspectives - How Christian Spirituality Could be of Use

In this last part, new perspectives inspired by Catholic faith are outlined. These perspectives, as a way to unify the spirit of an enterprise, respect also the diversity that business is walking into. One can bring into focus perspectives such as servant leadership, centrality of human development, business as a community as well as the role of virtues, and values framework amongst others.

Servant Leadership

One path is servant leadership, which is based on religious faith.⁹² The adoption of a servant's attitude not only reflects and celebrates the lesson taught by Jesus when he washed the feet of his disciples; but also highlights the difference between leadership, and authoritarian exercise of power and management. Guitián, in his study, presents the ethical concept of service as a

⁸⁹ See Kenneth E. Goodpaster and Laura L. Nash, *Policies and Persons* (New York: McGraw-Hill, ³1998), 135-150.

⁹⁰ See Dennis P. McCann, "Umpire and Batsman: Is it Cricket to be both?," *Journal of Business Ethics* 5 (1986): 445-452.

⁹¹ Verstraeten, "How Faith Makes a Difference," 4.

⁹² See Robert K. Greenleaf, *Servant Leadership: A Journey into the Nature of Legitimate Power and Greatness* (New York: Paulist Press, 2002).

way of specifying higher ethical principles in business practice. He argued that this ethical concept of service can act as a bridge for bringing love, benevolence, consideration and other related concepts into business practice. Furthermore, service provides ethical growth through virtue.⁹³ This “provides business leaders with a larger perspective and helps them to balance the demands of the business world with those of ethical social principles, illuminated for Christians by the Gospel.”⁹⁴ When Christian business leaders fail to live the Gospel in their organisations, their lives “conceal rather than reveal the authentic face of God and religion.”⁹⁵ Thus, importance must be awarded to personal growth, working towards a state of a whole self, unfolding of individuality and the development of moral strength and consistency.⁹⁶ It is the holistic and integrated life, involving “integrating mind, body and spirit in all spheres of life, including work.”⁹⁷

“When the gifts of the spiritual life are embraced and integrated into the active life, they provide the grace needed to overcome the divided life and to humanise us, especially in our work.”⁹⁸ Moreover:

The Church calls the Christian business leader to receive the sacraments, to accept the Scriptures, to honour the Sabbath, to pray, to participate in silence and in other disciplines of the spiritual life. These are not optional actions for a Christian, not mere private acts separated and disconnected from business.⁹⁹

Authentic Human Development

Another path is the authentic human development. An area which requires effective application of spirituality is the area of how employees are treated.

⁹³ See Gregorio Guitián, “Service as a Bridge Between Ethical Principles and Business Practice: A Catholic Social Teaching Perspective,” *Journal of Business Ethics* 127 (2014): 59-72.

⁹⁴ Harrington et al, *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 2.

⁹⁵ *GS* 19.

⁹⁶ See Cécile Rozuel, “The Moral Threat of Compartmentalization: Self, Roles and Responsibility,” *Journal of Business Ethics* 102/4 (2011): 688. Cécile Rozuel, “The Moral Threat of Compartmentalization,” 658: “The moral responsibility requires us to move away from a role-based life game which leads us to compartmentalize and forget who we are and what we value at a significant cost. On the contrary, an understanding of the process of compartmentalization and a greater awareness of the complex yet holistic nature of the self-contribute to furthering moral integrity and responsibility.”

⁹⁷ Judi Neal David Miller and Tim Ewest, *The Integration Box (TIB): An Individual and Institutional Faith, Religion, and spirituality at Work Assessment Tool* [Online]. Princeton University. <http://www.princeton.edu/faithandwork/tib/research/vienna>, 3.

⁹⁸ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 68.

⁹⁹ *Ibid.*

Employees are not mere human resources or human capital, but human beings with capacities, qualities, intelligence and freedom - human beings who are in search of satisfying genuine human needs, enhancing their spiritual well-being and their religious freedom. A business leader leads and focuses on employees and people, whereas a manager manages things. A leader is someone who influences people towards achieving an objective, an aim for the common good. For a Christian leader, who is also a witness of the social message of the Catholic Church,¹⁰⁰ the objective is the integral human development. In fact, for the Catholic Social Teaching (which is also considered as moral theology in practice) integral human development is the centre of social thought and action. It is a vocation at which all personal, social, and political activity must be directed.

The centrality of human development in business is outlined in the book; *Human Development in Business: Values and Humanistic Management in the Encyclical Caritas in Veritate*, edited by Domènec Melé and Claus Dierksmeier.¹⁰¹ Psychologists like Abraham Maslow and Carl Rogers, management thinkers like Elton Mayo and Mary Parker Follett have proposed a humanistic approach to leadership in companies. Benedict XVI also appealed in his 2009 encyclical letter *Caritas in Veritate*, for the creation of “a new humanistic synthesis,”¹⁰² that demands placing man at the centre of conducting business, or as Sandelands emphasised; “the Business of Business is the Human Person.”¹⁰³ Thus, this humanistic management - which is a descriptive perspective - must be understood as a way of how leadership ought to be conducted.

¹⁰⁰ See *ibid.*, 60: “Today more than ever,” St. John Paul II wrote, “the Church is aware that her social message will gain credibility more immediately from the *witness of actions* than as a result of its internal logic and consistency.” These witnesses of action, the great majority of whom are among the lay faithful, are not “solely passive beneficiaries but are the protagonists of the Church’s social doctrine at the vital moment of its implementation. They are also valuable collaborators of the pastors in its formulation, thanks to the experience they have acquired in the field and to their own specific skills.” *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 62: “Business leaders are supported and guided by the Church as well as by Christian business organisations to live out the Gospel in the world. Without these practitioners and the organisations that support them, the Catholic social tradition would become merely inanimate words rather than a lived reality. As St. James tells us, faith without works is dead (Jas 2:17).”

¹⁰¹ *Human Development in Business: Values and Humanistic Management in the Encyclical ‘Caritas in Veritate’*, eds., Domènec Melé and C. Dierksmeier (Basingstoke-New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2012).

¹⁰² Pope Benedict XVI, Encyclical Letter *Caritas in Veritate*, [CV] 21.

¹⁰³ Lloyd Sandelands, “The Business of Business is the Human Person: Lessons from the Catholic Social Tradition,” *Journal of Business Ethics* 85/1 (2009): 93-101

In his study, Sandelands, also describes a person-centred ethic of business that is based upon eight social principles, which are; 1) the principle of the common good, 2) the universal destination of goods, 3) the principle of subsidiarity, 4) participation, 5) the principle of solidarity, 6) the fundamental values of social life, 7) the way of love, 8) business is a glory of God.¹⁰⁴ The latter principle came to me as a surprise considering the negative connotations that business carries along with those involved in it. However, it is also consolatory to read that “business glorifies God *as it helps man to his incarnation*; to his realization of God in becoming a person and to his embodiment of God in taking part in a union of male and female in one flesh.”¹⁰⁵ Furthermore, following Novak,¹⁰⁶ in business there are “three cardinal virtues in whose exercise man comes to be in God: creativity, building community, and practical realism.”¹⁰⁷ Therefore, “entrepreneurs ... should be encouraged to recognise their work as a true vocation and to respond to God’s call in the spirit of true disciples. In doing so, they engage in the noble task of serving their brothers and sisters and of building up the Kingdom of God.”¹⁰⁸

Community of Persons

Moreover, a business leader serves to pursue the authentic development of every person and all of humanity, since a firm is a community of persons¹⁰⁹ - one which is “made up of relations or feelings with a sense of fellowship.”¹¹⁰

When we consider a business organisation as a community of persons, it becomes clear that the bonds which hold us in common are not merely legal contracts or mutual self-interests, but commitments to real goods, shared with others to serve the world.¹¹¹

Work can and should be one such commitment, where people work with each other, and their work is characterised by the unification of people and the

¹⁰⁴ See *ibid.*, 97-100.

¹⁰⁵ *Ibid.*, 99. My emphasis.

¹⁰⁶ Michael Novak, *Business as a Calling: Work and the Examined Life* (New York: Free Press, 1996).

¹⁰⁷ Sandelands, “The Business of Business is the Human Person,” 99.

¹⁰⁸ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 87.

¹⁰⁹ Domènec Melé, “The Firm as a ‘Community of Persons’: A Pillar of Humanistic Business Ethos,” *Journal of Business Ethics, Journal of Business Ethics* 106/1 (2011): 89-101.

¹¹⁰ *Ibid.*, 92.

¹¹¹ Harrington et al., *Vocation of the Business Leader*, 58.

building of a community.¹¹² This understanding helps avoid the spiritual poverty that often arises in market economies due to the lack of human relationships within and around a business.¹¹³

Being a 'community of persons' emphasizes both individuals and the whole, and makes explicit the uniqueness, conscience, free will, dignity and openness to human flourishing. This requires appropriate communication about and participation in matters which affect people's life, and makes it essential to cooperate for the common good of the business firm and the society.¹¹⁴

Furthermore, as Pope Benedict XVI says in *Caritas in Veritate*: "Man's earthly activity, when inspired and sustained by charity, contributes to the building of the universal city of God, which is the goal of the history of the human family."¹¹⁵ There is the growth of the community of persons and the kingdom of God through the leader's business activity. As noted by Naughton, significant obstacles could be encountered when attempting to create a community of work on such principles in large publicly traded companies. In spite of this however, there exist around 800 companies which follow, celebrate and engage in the practice of the "economy of communion." Furthermore, there are cooperatives such as Mondragon Cooperative, which was inspired and guided by the vision of Fr. Don José Maria Arrizmendiarieta, whose theology and philosophy of work was grounded in the Catholic social tradition.¹¹⁶

Values Framework and Dimension of Work

Another path is the values framework. In their study, Jurkiewicz and Giacalone points out a value framework of workplace spirituality. The value framework includes benevolence, generativity, humanism, integrity, justice, mutuality, receptivity, respect, responsibility and trust.¹¹⁷ These ten values are consistent with what Pfeffer asserts are the:

¹¹² See Pope John Paul II, Encyclical Letter *Laborem Exercens*, http://w2.vatican.va/content/john-paul-ii/en/encyclicals/documents/hf_jp-ii_enc_14091981_laborem-exercens.html, 20. Hereunder referred as LE.

¹¹³ See *CV* 53.

¹¹⁴ Melé, "The firm as a 'Community of Persons,'" 89.

¹¹⁵ *CV* 7.

¹¹⁶ See Naughton, "The Corporation as a Community of Work," 70-76.

¹¹⁷ See Carole L. Jurkiewicz and Robert A. Giacalone, "A Values Framework for Measuring the Impact of Workplace Spirituality on Organizational Performance," *Journal of Business Ethics* 49 (2004): 129-142.

Four fundamental dimensions of what people seek in the workplace:

- 1) interesting work that permits them to learn, develop, and have a sense of competence and mastery;
- 2) meaningful work that provides some feeling of purpose
- 3) a sense of connection and positive social relations with their co-workers, and
- 4) the ability to live an integrated life, so that one's work role and other roles are not inherently in conflict and so that a person's work does not conflict with his or her essential nature and who the person is as a human being.¹¹⁸

The business leader can create a framework for the workplace, where these values are put into practice, while also having a Christian flavour. Furthermore, the critical challenge for entrepreneurs as well as scholars in entrepreneurship, is to begin to *integrate* the subjective and objective dimensions of work. If entrepreneurs were to create organizations without due regard to the objective dimensions of work, chaos would reign as a prelude to bankruptcy. But in a similar way, if they were to create organizations without recognizing the subjective dimension of work, chaos of a different nature would reign, namely, the moral and spiritual stagnation of persons. It is in light of this challenge of integration that the Catholic social tradition proposes the role of *virtue* as a critical framework to integrate the subjective and objective dimensions of entrepreneurial work.¹¹⁹ It is also of utmost importance to have a holistic overview of the person, taking into consideration his dimensions, necessities, his history, his whereabouts and his development.

Pope John Paul II asked business leaders and employees to develop a spirituality of work, enabling them to see their role in God's creative and redemptive purpose and giving them the strength and virtue to live out His call.¹²⁰ Pope Francis explains however, that "without prolonged moments of adoration, of prayerful encounter with the word, of sincere conversation with the Lord, our work easily becomes meaningless; we lose energy as a result of weariness and difficulties, and our fervour dies out."¹²¹ A spirituality of work is an attitude

¹¹⁸ Jeffrey Pfeffer, "Business and Spirit: Management Practices that Sustain Values," in *The Handbook of Workplace Spirituality and Organizational Performance*, eds. Robert A. Giacalone and Carole L. Jurkiewicz (Armonk: M.E. Sharpe, 2003), 32.

¹¹⁹ Jeffrey R. Corwall and Michael J. Naughton, "Who is the Good Entrepreneur? An Exploration within the Catholic Social Tradition," *Journal of Business Ethics* 44 (2003): 61-75, 65.

¹²⁰ See *LE* 99.

¹²¹ *EG* 62.

of the mind and a condition of the soul that constantly asks three simple yet profound human questions: Where do I come from?, Where am I going?, Who am I? These questions are far from trivial. Their concerns describe the structure of spirituality itself. "If I would understand the present, I must understand my origin and destiny; if I would understand who I am, I must explore where I came from and where I am going. If we avoid these questions, we avoid ourselves."¹²² The business leader is to embrace and reflect on these questions, while also creating the favourable framework for employees to do the same.

Virtue as a Benchmark and Role of Virtues in Entrepreneurship

Cavanagh and Bandsuch propose that spirituality's ability to stimulate and support good moral habits and personal virtue is the most determinative test of the best benchmark for the appropriateness of a spirituality in the workplace.¹²³ "As a norm or benchmark to assist business people in deciding which spiritualities are appropriate for the workplace," Cavanagh and Bandsuch propose that "managers support those spiritualities that promote good moral behaviour and good character, because such spiritualities will maximize the benefits of a spirituality in the workplace while minimizing the potential problems."¹²⁴

Thus, managerial virtue unites technical expertise with moral and even spiritual leadership. In their study and in light of their discussion, Cornwall and Naughton concluded that proper ordering of the three distinct kinds of goods is necessary for the entrepreneur to define the activity as *virtuous* which serves as the basis of authentic success. These are: "(1) the good of being technically competent, (2) the good of the individual (subjective dimension of work) and (3) the good of community (social order of work)."¹²⁵

Conclusion

Following the review of some non-theistic spirituality forms, positive signs and hope in spirituality and the business activity become apparent, particularly where the business leader is concerned. There are good grounds of encounters with a theistic form of spirituality. In the last part of the paper, theistic perspectives of how Christian spirituality could help have been discussed. These

¹²² Alford and Naughton, *Managing as If Faith Mattered*, 211.

¹²³ Cavanagh and Bandsuch, "Virtue as a Benchmark for Spirituality in Business," 112.

¹²⁴ *Ibid.*, 116.

¹²⁵ Cornwall and Naughton, "Who is the Good Entrepreneur?," 71.

included: servant leadership, the authentic human development, the community of persons and the values framework. These perspectives were discussed in light of finding the right means to bridge the gap in the issues that business leaders encounter in today's world, especially with regards to leading a divided life. Business is a vocation, which glorifies God as it helps man to his incarnation. Thus, a spirituality that is appropriate enables the achievement of a teleological end, which is the common good. Furthermore, the spirituality of the business leader influences the values that he applies, through the values framework. These values will be practiced repeatedly, through servant leadership and will consequently become a *habitus*, a good moral habit; a virtue.

With this said, two questions are brought to light: what virtues are necessary in today's world for a business leader to acquire and practice a new, more humane economic and leadership vision? Does this encounter have to be from the perspective of justice or from the perspective of love? Currently, 'justice' is not so present in the economy. Normally, the term 'justice' is referred to more frequently where distribution is concerned. For a more universal theory, one has to be more rational and reasonable, and maybe less theological. Justice will appeal more than universal love feelings. For example, if someone is unjust to another, the latter would be outraged. If he loves God however, he would be more willing to forgive and move on. The moment that one uses the theological concept of love in this regard, is the moment that he starts to risk failure in making this category universal. Thus one must be cautious and aware of the limit. Justice could be more appealing, even though it emanates from Christian love. This virtue - Christian justice flowing from Christian love - will influence the character of the leader which in return influences the workplace in the authentic human development process. The leader also influences the community of persons in the spirituality of work.

David Cortis
Department of Moral Theology
Faculty of Theology
University of Malta
Msida MSD 2080
Malta

david.cortis@um.edu.mt